

Community Profile

Montauk, New York

By Bryan Oles

I. Community Description

The village of Montauk, known as the "Fishing Capital of the World," is the largest fishing port in the state of New York. The village is the principal port of a large commercial fishing fleet that landed over 14 million pounds of seafood worth over \$13 million in 2001 (NMFS weighout data). Montauk is also the home port of a significant charter and party boat fleet, and a major site of recreational fishing activity. Geographically, Montauk is located at the eastern end of the South Fork of Long Island, between the Atlantic Ocean to the south, and Block Island Sound to the north. Montauk is connected to points west via Route 27, and the Metropolitan Transportation Authority's Long Island Rail Road.¹ Both commercial and recreational fishing fleets are concentrated in Lake Montauk, which was once a brackish pond, known as Great Pond. In 1927 the pond was dredged and an inlet created in the north, permanently opening the water to Block Island Sound. Politically, Montauk is an unincorporated village of East Hampton Township in Suffolk County.

Montauk was originally inhabited by Native American Algonquians who provided early settlers the right to pasture livestock on the land in the mid-1600s. The Native Americans, known as Montaukets, later sold the territory to East Hampton settlers in 1686, who held the land in joint trust for roughly two centuries. During this time, Montauk served as the summer pasture land for cattle, sheep, and horses. Montauk Lighthouse was one of the early structures on "the End". It was commissioned by George Washington and built in 1797. Houses built for the shepherds at the end of the 18th century were the only other structures in Montauk until the late 1800s.

The heirs of the original "Proprietors" held Montauk as a corporation until 1879, when the land was sold by court order to Arthur Benson, a prosperous speculator. He and a number of associates established a few houses at the Point, including a hunting and fishing lodge, inaugurating the tourist trade on Montauk. Austin Corbin, one of Benson's associates and the owner of Long Island Railroad, bought 5,500 acres of land in Montauk and extended the railroad to Fort Pond Bay in 1895. He hoped to make Montauk the first port of landing on the East Coast, from which goods and passengers would be transported to New York via the rail. While his grandiose vision was not fulfilled, the rail provided the necessary infrastructure for the transportation of seafood, and Montauk soon became the principal commercial fishing port on the East End. In the early 1900s, the railroad also brought recreational fishermen to the area from the city by the car-load aboard the "Fishermen's Special", depositing them right at the dock where they could board sportfishing charter and party boats.

¹ Montauk Airport on East Lake Drive provides another mode of access to the area, but is strictly for small, private aircraft.

Montauk's reputation as a resort was later marketed by Carl Fisher, who purchased 10,000 acres of the land in 1925. He envisioned Montauk as the "Miami Beach of the North," and began to develop the area into a resort with the construction of the Tudor-style Montauk Manor. This resort featured 178 guest rooms, access to the newly built golf course, polo fields, and tennis courts. He also built a yacht club, town office building, and housing developments. Sportfishing was integral component of Fisher's plans, for the area was already known as a prime sportfishing destination.

Prior to Fisher's development, the village of Montauk was located on the southern end of Fort Pond Bay where numerous fishing shanties and commercial docks were clustered along the waterfront. Because this area was largely unsheltered from the northeasterly winds and storms, Fisher created an inlet to Great Pond from Block Island Sound, dredged the bottom, and built Montauk Lake Club. Lake Montauk, as it became known, soon attracted sportfishing boats. The new harbor did not become the principal site of commercial fishing and party boat activities until many years later. A number of events encouraged boats to relocate to the harbor including the hurricane of 1938, which devastated Fort Pond Bay, and the establishment of the U.S. Navy torpedo testing facility. Party boats continued to operate from Fort Pond Bay at the "Fishangri-la" dock, which was established after World War Two.

Fisher's vision for Montauk was largely unfulfilled as a result of the Great Depression that resulted in Fisher's bankruptcy in 1932. By the 1950s, much of Fisher's development had fallen into disrepair. While Montauk never rivaled Miami Beach, it has remained an important tourist destination since the time of Carl Fisher. Throughout the mid 1900s, small, inexpensive motels and tourist-related businesses cropped up in Montauk, many of which catered to sportfishermen. Development around Lake Montauk burgeoned with the establishment of numerous recreational marinas, commercial docks, restaurants, and motels.²

In 2000, Montauk had a year-round population of 3,851, up 28.32% from 1990 (US Census). The seasonal population balloons during the summer to over 20,000 people (Horne Rose LLC et al. 2003:14). The village economy is largely dependent on tourism and continues to experience growth in real estate. The cost of living in Montauk has been rising and the lack of affordable housing has become a great concern of the Town of East Hampton in recent years. Montauk remains intimately tied to the water. Commercial and recreational fishing are inextricable aspects of the community's socioeconomic life and identity.

II. Dependency and Engagement in the Fisheries

A. Commercial Fishing

² For more information on the area's history, see Rattray 1989; Montauk-online.com 2000a; Montauk-online.com 2000b.

History and Current Description

Montauk is a contemporary fishing village embedded in the larger history of East Hampton Township, which is famous for its baymen and surfmen who worked the waters for generations. The legendary fishing families of East Hampton have been immortalized in Peter Matthiessen's *Men's Lives* (1986), which describes the historical travails of baymen and haul seiners on the South Fork. Many fisheries have come and gone since the early days of settlement. In the 1800s communities would employ haul seines to capture bunker, or menhaden, which were once valued as fertilizer. There were thirty full-time seine gangs who harvested bunker for farmers in 1840 (Matthiessen 1986:120). Later, bunker processing plants were established near Montauk, such as the Smith Meal Company at Promised Land in Napeague. There were some 232 sailing craft and 24 steam ships working Gardiner's Bay for bunker in 1880 (ibid.). Some fishermen would alternate between working ocean pound nets and crewing on the bunker steamers in the summer. Bunker processing waxed and waned in the 1920s and 30s with the fluctuations in availability of product. Production at the Smith Meal Company was halted during World War II, but resumed when the previously requisitioned steam ships were returned. The factory, or "Bunker City" as it was known, was closed in 1968.

Early days of commercial fishing in Montauk featured a variety of other gear types. The Norwegian gillnet, introduced in the 1880s, was used to catch cod in the Atlantic and numerous other species in the bays. Fyke nets and haul seines were used to catch striped bass among other species in the ocean and bays. Pound nets, or traps, were also very important in the early days of commercial fishing on the East End. One long-time resident estimated that there were 25 pound netting crews operating in the area in the early 1900s. A map from the early 1900s depicts the location of approximately 300 traps between Montauk Point and Gardiner's Island (ibid: 90). In addition to these fisheries, baymen raked clams, dredged for scallops, and employed myriad additional techniques for the capture of fish and shellfish.

In the late 1800s and early 1900s, commercial fishing docks in Montauk were clustered along the shoreline of Fort Pond Bay. Old timers remember the Montauk Fishing Supply company, Duryea's fish house, and other establishments. The Long Island Railroad was extended to Fort Pond in 1895, providing pivotal access to markets in New York City. Prior to this, commercial fishing in Montauk was not a significant industry. With the establishment of the railroad, Montauk became the primary port on the East End for the shipment of seafood.

The community settlement and fishing infrastructure of Fort Pond Bay was decimated by a hurricane in 1938. Thereafter, the commercial fleet gradually relocated to Montauk Harbor in Lake Montauk, which was dredged and opened to Block Island Sound in 1927 by the developer, Carl Fisher. Lake Montauk afforded greater protection from storms and was attracting more and more infrastructure including fish docks. By this time, harpooning swordfish was a productive commercial fishery. In addition, many commercial fishermen converted their work boats to take advantage of the burgeoning charter industry, which attracted over 5,000 customers in 1932 (ibid: 91). After World

War II, Montauk became the principal port of larger vessels, including offshore draggers and longliners. Longlining for tuna and sword fish has since declined, and the longline fleet in Montauk today primarily targets tilefish. Other fisheries associated with the Montauk fleet include lobster potting and pin-hooking - hook and line fishing for striped bass, sea bass, and other species.

Today there are approximately 50 to 75 full-time commercial fishing boats that operate out of Montauk including approximately 20 draggers, 20-30 pinhookers, 10-20 lobstermen, four longliners, and a handful of baymen.³ Vessel Trip Report (VTR) data indicate that 81 federally-permitted commercial boats landed 1,820 trips in Montauk in 2001. Sixty four of these boats claim Montauk as their principal port of landing. These boats landed 1,596 trips in Montauk 2001, or 88% of all trips landed in Montauk by federally permitted boats. The reported gear types among these boats in 2001 included handline, bottom fishing otter trawl, bottom longline, lobster pot, fish pot, sinking gill net, and beam otter trawl. The seventeen boats that landed in Montauk that did not have Montauk listed as principal port came from other ports in New York, Rhode Island, Connecticut, and Massachusetts.

The fleet in Montauk is primarily composed of owner-operated boats. An analysis of 2001 VTR data on federally permitted boats that designate Montauk as their principal port indicate that these boats (n=64) range up to 92 feet long, and average 44 feet in length, 40 gross tons and 384 horsepower. The average year built is 1978. These boats reported a total of 1,806 trips. Of these trips, 88% were landed in Montauk. Other ports of landing included (in order of trip number), Shinnecock, NY, Point Lookout, NY, Chatham, MA, Mattituck, NY, Point Pleasant, NJ, 'Other Suffolk', NY, Marshfield, MA, Barnstable, MA, Gloucester, MA, New Bedford, MA, Newport, RI, Point Judith, RI, and Wanchese, NC.

Weight data presented in Appendix 1 depict the different gear types used in the capture of fish landed in Montauk since 1994 and the percentage of value and pounds for which they account. They demonstrate the wide range of gear types utilized. These data indicate that two main gear types accounted for 82% of the total value landed in 2001 - otter trawl, fish, bottom (61%) and longline, bottom (21%). The diachronic perspective shows that otter trawl, fish, bottom has accounted for at least 39% (1994) and as much as 69% (1999) of the value landed in Montauk since 1994. Longline, bottom has accounted for between 12% (1999) and 34% (1996) of the total value of landings in Montauk. Other important gear types include the handline, which accounted for 7% of the total value landed in 2001, and the lobster pot, which brought in 4% of the total 2001 value. One interesting trend revealed by the data is the declining contribution of pelagic longlining to the total value landed in Montauk. In 1994 pelagic longlining accounted for

³ Among the baymen who dock in Montauk and/or land catch in Montauk, there are between one and ten who clam and scallop, or fish for crab, conch, or eel; one to three fish potters who target sea bass, blackfish, and porgy; one to two pound net fishermen; and, two to four gillnetters who fish seasonally for bluefish and striped bass. There is a great deal of mobility among baymen that varies with seasons and species availability, and baymen may not be considered part of the permanent fleet in Montauk (Gall 1994).

23% of the total value landed. This percentage dwindled to 4% by 2001. Transient pelagic longliners still land in Montauk, but there are fewer today than in the 1990s.⁴ Weighout data presented in Appendix 2 show the changing percentages of value and pounds of species landed in Montauk between 1994 and 2001. They demonstrate that whiting (23%), squid (20%) and tilefish (20%) accounted for the largest percentages of total value landed in 2001. Since 1994, whiting has accounted for at least 10% of the total value landed. Tilefish contributed a high of 33% of the total value in 1996, and dropped to a low of 12% in 1999. Squid's contribution to total value has fluctuated over the years from a low of 8% in 1995 to a high of 33% in 1999. These species are followed by finfish⁵ (9%); lobster, flounder, fluke, and 'other'⁶, each of which accounted for 5% of the total value landed in 2001; tuna (3%); swordfish (2%); pelagics (2%); monkfish (1%); and dogfish, scallops, and shellfish - each representing under 1% of the total value landed. Among the notable trends is the decline in the percentage of total value attributed to tuna, which dropped from 25% in 1994 to 3% in 2001. According to a 1994 report, flatfish species including fluke, winter flounder, and yellowtail flounder were much more important to the Montauk fleet in the 1980s (Gall 1994). Declines in flatfish stocks and aggressive regulatory strategies prompted a re-direction of fishing effort towards underutilized species like squid and whiting which have become, along with tilefish, the leading species.

The importance of various species to the total annual Montauk catch has varied from year to year. Tilefish has consistently been one of the most important species in terms of both volume and value landed in Montauk for the past decade. Smaller amounts of high value species like tuna, lobster, and swordfish have also been economically important to Montauk-based commercial fishermen. Flatfish species like fluke (summer flounder), winter flounder, and yellowtail flounder were important for much of the past decade, but as stocks declined and conservation strategies were implemented their economic importance has also declined over the past several years. The Montauk fleet has re-directed fishing effort to catching species like squid and whiting. The amount of squid and whiting landed by commercial fishermen in Montauk has increased dramatically over the past decade. More squid and whiting were landed at Montauk than all other species combined in 1993, and these species ranked second and third respectively in terms of dockside value last year.

Representatives from three of the largest fisheries including otter trawling, tilefish longlining, and pinhooking described some of the important aspects of their fisheries. Among the trawlers of Montauk, six captains, each with approximately 30 years of fishing experience, moved to Montauk in the 1970s and established a cooperative. Most

⁴ An industry representative from Montauk noted that there are approximately 1,200 state-licensed boats in New York State that were not required to report landings prior to April 2003, hundreds of which are part of the Montauk fleet. This indicates that weighout data may not accurately characterize the Montauk fleet gear types and landings.

⁵ The "finfish" category includes Atlantic croaker, scup, black sea bass, weakfish, striped bass, and spot

⁶ The "other" category includes all species other than those accounted for in weighout data categories (whiting, monkfish, flounder, pelagics, finfish, tuna, fluke, dogfish, lobster, scallop, squid, shellfish, surf clam and ocean quahog, swordfish, eel, tilefish)

of the offshore draggers that land in Montauk pack out of their dock. Representatives from this fishery emphasize that they engage in a "mixed trawl" fishery that depends on a variety of species including whiting, squid, flounder, scup, and fluke. In this fishery, a captain may target a certain species during a trip if available in large numbers, but may also attempt to land the limit of other available species as well. In the mid-1980s, the federal government encouraged fishermen to pursue underutilized species such as squid and whiting by providing them with low interest loans for the purchase of boats and gear. In order to qualify for the loans, fishermen had to demonstrate a history of groundfish landings. Those with the greatest activity in groundfishing were provided the most attractive incentives to move into the underutilized fisheries. As a result, fishermen who invested in underutilized species such as those in the Montauk dragger fleet became vulnerable to "use it or lose it" regulatory policies that limit the days at sea among those who have spent less time fishing for groundfish in subsequent years. Today, most draggers in Montauk still target groundfish as well as the underutilized species, but there is great concern for the future of groundfishing as a result of recent court decisions that further limit days at sea.

One full-time pinhooker described trends in the hook and line fishery. Pinhookers have been part of the commercial fleet of Montauk since the beginning of the industry. In recent years, part-timers have been cutting into the available quota, making it difficult for full-time fishermen to make a living. There are approximately 12 full-time pinhookers and over 100 part time "weekenders." The number of full time hook and line boats declined as a result of a collapse in the scup fishery in the 1980s. Those who stayed in the fishery made a decent living, but currently the prices are down as a result of derby fishing in the scup and sea bass fishery that is compelled by the quarterly quota system.

The tilefishing fleet is currently composed of four boats. The fishery was originated by fishermen from New Jersey who would land their catch in Montauk. There were up to ten tilefishing boats in Montauk during the 1970s, most of which operated part-time. In the late 1970s, two local lobster fishermen got into the fishery. One of these men traveled to Florida where he learned the value of individually baited, circle hooks, snap on gear, and wire cable. These innovations in the tilefish fishery replaced the use of machine-baited J-hooks and monofilament lines, and brought in more fish. However, the labor intensive process involved in employing the gear drove out many of the tilefishing boats in the 1980s. The tilefish fishery management plan went into effect in November 2001. In the plan, each of the four boats in Montauk's tilefishing fleet is designated "tier one" status. Tier one is allotted 66% of the total allowable catch.

Seasonal Round

The fishing activities of boats in the Montauk commercial fleet vary by gear type and depend on a host of factors including the availability of species, weather and conditions at sea, and the increasingly restrictive regulatory environment.

Among boats in the dragger fleet, the seasonal movements are largely dictated by fishery regulations. The draggers engage in a mixed-trawl fishery, targeting squid, whiting,

butterfish, mackerel, groundfish, and a host of Mid-Atlantic species such as scup, sea bass, and fluke. Presently, squid and whiting are the "bread and butter" of the fleet largely as a result of state by state quotas that prevent the larger boats from targeting Mid-Atlantic species when they are inshore. When species such as scup, sea bass, and fluke move inshore during the spring and summer, the miniscule trip limits effectively prevent the larger boats from targeting these species. A 100 pound limit on scup and a 50 pound limit on fluke, for example, do not pay for the cost of the trip. For this reason, draggers typically target squid and whiting. The squid are usually "off the beach" close to shore in the summer. In 2001, for example, the Montauk boats were fishing just outside of the Shinnecock Inlet due to the mass of squid available. In 2003, however, the squid did not show up in the summer and so many of the draggers traveled to northern waters for groundfish. Most of the draggers maintain groundfish permits. The recent Kessler ruling that cut back the number of days at sea available to groundfish permit holders affected the Montauk fleet (CLF, et al. v. Evans, Civil. No. 00-1134 GK (D.D.C., December 28, 2001)). While some boats still have over 60 days at sea, others have as few as nine.

The days at sea allowances, seasonal area closures, regulatory cycles, and availability of species dictate the timing of groundfishing among the draggers. For example, some will fish for groundfish during the months of March and April in order to use up any remaining days at sea prior to the end of the groundfishing regulatory year (end of April). Fishermen understand that unless they use their permits, the permits will be rendered useless by the "use it or lose it" policies whereby days at sea and quota allocations are determined by historical participation. In the past, if the squid were available and the price of whiting was high, fishermen might not bother with the difficulties associated with groundfishing. Today they are sure to utilize all allotted days at sea for groundfish. Others smaller draggers will use their days at sea fishing local waters for blackback flounder and yellowtail rather than travel to New England. In the fall, draggers continue to target whiting and squid. Depending on trip limits, boats may also catch Mid-Atlantic species such as fluke in the months of October, November, and December. Much of the fishing at this time of year and into the winter is weather dependent. In recent years the boats start fishing for scup and sea bass in January due to warmer water temperatures that have brought the fish up from the south. A 9,000 pound trip limit made this profitable during the months of January, February, and March. Southern states such as North Carolina and Virginia lobbied for state by state quotas which resulted in a smaller share for New York and a greatly reduced trip limit (500 pounds). Restrictive trip limits in New York encourage fishermen to go elsewhere. One dragger captain who maintains a New Jersey fluke permit explained that he fishes out of Point Pleasant, NJ in January and February when he can land 7,500 pounds, and September and October when the trip limit is 4,000 pounds. On the way back to Montauk he will typically drag for squid. He also groundfishes in the summer out of Montauk. In short, the seasonal movements of the dragger fleet are very much dependent on conditions dictated by both the natural and regulatory environments. Most of the dragger crew members are employed in the commercial fishery year round, but some crew charter boats in the summer. The primary

dock that packs out the dragger fleet operates year round, employing a manager, administrative assistant, and up to 6 dock hands through the winter.⁷

Pinhookers operate primarily in the spring and summer. Spring fishing targets species such as fluke, scup, bluefish, and blackback flounder. In the summer, pinhookers also catch sea bass, blackfish, and striped bass in addition to these species. Much of the summer fishing is conducted in state waters around Montauk Point and Gardiner's Island. Striped bass fishing lasts until December. The part time pinhookers are primarily engaged in the summer fishery. Many of the part timers are retirees, or those with a land job elsewhere. Among the few full-time pinhookers, fall and winter is a time for striped bass, codfish, blackfish, ling (red hake), and cunner. Ling and cod are typically caught between three and 10 miles offshore. Winter fishing is highly dependent on conditions at sea and the weather. Once the porgy and sea bass move offshore the season is effectively over. The full-time pinhookers haul out in December and go back in the water in May. Some may keep the boat in the water in order to fish for cod in the winter when the weather allows. During the winter, pinhookers may engage in other income-earning activities such as painting, carpentry, or dock repair.

The tilefishing fleet fishes for tilefish year round, but they try to bring the fish to market when the market is good. One boat in the fleet also fishes for swordfish on occasion. The tilefish permit holders in Montauk have made an informal arrangement with one another to share the 66% of the total allowable catch that, as 'tier one' boats in the FMP, they are allocated. This has allowed the crews to work year round, avoid the derby-style behavior that usually accompanies quota management, and keep the dock supplied throughout the year. In the past, when the boats operated with two crews, (each with 4 crew members), crew members could take a trip on a dragger or go pinhooking in the summer when they had off. Presently, the boats operate with only one crew which does not allow for too much jumping back and forth. Crew members do, however, supplement income earned by working on the tilefishing boats by crewing in other fisheries on occasion, clamming, or working at a land job such as landscaping. The dock that packs the tilefishing fleet is most busy between May and October when they also receive the business of the inshore fishermen and charter boats that buy bait and fuel. December through March is the down time, but they continue to pack tilefish. They used to pack more cod and dogfish during the winter.

Crew Description

It is extremely difficult to establish an accurate figure for the number of crew in the Montauk commercial fishing fleet. Vessel Trip Report data indicate that the 69 boats listing Montauk as principal port that landed trips in 2001 had an average crew size of two. This would place the number of crew at 138. However, counting the number of boats and multiplying by an estimated number of crew is highly inaccurate due to the fact that certain boats have multiple crews. In addition, there are numerous part-time

⁷ The dock laid off four dock hands in 2003 as a result of the reduced winter sea bass quota and restrictive trip limits (500 pounds), coupled with the lack of squid during the spring and summer that compelled captains to travel to New England for groundfish.

pinhookers and baymen that move in and out of the area, as well as boats that do not have federal permits, which are not accounted for by VTR data. One informant estimates that there are approximately 300 fishing families in Montauk and East Hampton. According to informants, the fishing families in Montauk do not have deep genealogical roots in commercial fishing. Unlike the community of Amagansett, where fishing families trace their genealogical ties to early whalers, most of the families in Montauk are first generation fishermen. A number of Montauk fishermen grew up within a few towns of each other on Long Island, in areas such as Babylon. They came to Montauk in the 1960s and 70s and got started as clammers. It is said that few encourage their children to get into the industry.

Among offshore draggers, the number of crew varies. Most boats are said to be owner-operated, but certain owners have captains to work their boats part-time. One boat owner employs two other captains and five or six deck hands. They usually have three or four deck hands on each trip, but the number varies according to the length of voyage and the nature of the trip. Two or three of his crew are steady and an equal number are itinerants who are part of what is called the "recycling bin." The "recycling bin" includes those crew members who tend to bounce from boat to boat. Crew that come from the recycling bin are considered to be less desirable than "green" recruits who have little experience because the latter can be trained in a manner acceptable to captains while the former are too set in their ways. Turnover among crew is said to be fair. One captain employs eight crewmen who alternate between trips. Most are long standing crewmen who have been with him for five to seven years. He feels he is lucky to have such a good crew. "Maintaining a stable crew depends on the money that the boat makes. If the boat isn't making money, the crew are hard to find." His crew members are long-time residents of Montauk and East Hampton. Most moved to the area from other towns on Long Island and settled in Montauk. Another dragger captain rotates six crew members and has a second captain run the boat on occasion. They run with three or four crew members on most trips. His crew members generally stay on for a few years, but the captain has been with him for five years and he has had crew that last for 12 years. Most of his crew members live in Montauk, but one lives upstate in the winter and comes to fish during the spring and summer. He also noted the tendency of crew to bounce from one boat to another.

Captains and owners do not actively advertise for crew. Most crew members find a berth through word of mouth. In the past, dragger captains used to keep a waiting list of men who wanted to sign on as crew because crew were much more stable than they are at present. Most crew are said to be uneducated and unskilled outside of the fishing industry. Commercial fishing is less predictable than it was in the past due to increasingly restrictive regulations that create uncertainty. Because men can not rely on fishing as a stable and predictable means of making a living, fishing does not attract high quality, reliable crew members. One dragger explained that he and his partner decided against the purchase of another vessel for two reasons: they were uncertain whether or not the boat would make money in light of the "use it or lose it" regulations, and they would have a hard time hiring stable, dependable crew without the guarantee of high volume landings. Another dragger owner explained that it is extremely difficult to find

reliable captains to work his boat. "Only those men who have a supportive family and stable home life can be good captains due to the stress of fishing, the time away from home, and the dangers." A third dragger captain explained that the difficulty finding reliable crew is related to competition from the sportfishing industry and other tourist-related businesses. Some commercial crew members have gone into the lucrative charter boat industry. The commercial fishing industry also competes with the contract labor market for personnel. The contract labor market in East Hampton is a massive industry that draws on the pool of manual laborers. Many find jobs "banging nails", landscaping, or plumbing.

The tilefishing fleet has also experienced the difficulty of maintaining stable, reliable crews. To begin with, the fishery is labor intensive. The snap-on hooks are individually baited along the length of cable which can run between 20 and 40 miles. When the cable is hauled back the crew disgorge the fish, bait the hooks, clean the fish and set the cable again continuously. Of the four crew on board during trips, three are up at all times while one sleeps. Some crew rotate tasks, but some are not proficient baiters and so they gut the fish. Everyone snaps out, and the captain and one other crewman usually haul back. They are usually at sea for ten days and cover sixty to seventy miles a day. Prior to the imposition of the tilefish FMP the fleet used to employ double crews on each boat. One captain and three crew members would go out for ten days at a time and rotate with another crew composed of a captain and three deckhands. "It gave everyone a life - knowing that they had a living that was consistent and predictable." The predictability of the system is said to have encouraged crew to get married and have children, thereby promoting economic and social stability. The system allowed owners to crew their boats with reliable crew and to maintain their vessels properly.⁸ Following the imposition of the FMP, which took effect November 1, 2001, many of the tilefishing crew members have "gone land." The fleet lost many of the stable, reliable crew members. Three of the four boats have four stable crew members, but they employ additional crew when necessary. The trips have been shortened from ten days to seven or eight days in order to make the quota last longer, but each crew is home for a shorter period of time with their families - perhaps four or five days instead of ten. The quality of crew is said to have declined as a result of the FMP.

The declining quality of crew is related more broadly to the difficulty of following a career path that leads to boat ownership. It is said that many good people were driven out of business because boats are worthless without permits. Permits are limited and extremely expensive, preventing the recruitment of those with the hope of one day operating their own vessel.

Most of the owners of Montauk boats are said to be local, but some live in nearby towns such as Amagansett and Bridgehampton. Not all of the crew live in Montauk due to the high cost of living and the difficulty associated with finding affordable housing. Winter

⁸ Maintenance is estimated to run between \$50,000 and \$60,000 each year, plus \$40,000 in insurance premiums.

rents are low, but some get displaced when the summer rents are increased beyond their means.

Infrastructure

The fishing fleet of Montauk is located in Lake Montauk where a number of public and private docks provide slip space. One packing house on East Lake Drive provides space for approximately three draggers, two longliners, twenty pinhookers, and a lobsterman. A second packing house on East Lake Drive recently converted its operations and now caters strictly to sportfishing interests. The town of East Hampton maintains two docks, one on each side of Lake Montauk. According to one informant, there is a waiting list for access to town dock slip space and a number of requirements: lessee must live in East Hampton and the boat must fish at least 75 days a year. The cost (\$500/year) is very affordable relative to the slip fees charged by private marinas in the harbor that may exceed \$6000/year. One private marina is said to rent slip space to lobstermen, and one packing house/seafood retailer leases space to lobstermen as well.

There are two primary packing houses in Montauk and one dock that supplies ice and buys some product for resale. One of the packing houses is owned by a group of six trawler captains and has been in operation for over 15 years. The dock was initially leased and operated by the cooperative and later bought in 1999. This business ships product on consignment, and provides dockage, fuel, and ice. The facility features a packing dock, two forklifts, four packing booms, three box stapling machines, a semi-trailer, a Bobcat loader, ice machine, cooler, walk-in freezer, diesel fuel tank and gear storage yard. The dock packs the product of approximately 15 draggers, 20-30 pinhookers, a lobsterman, and a few longliners from North Carolina who occasionally land in Montauk. Eighty to ninety percent of the dock's business is from the boats owned by the dock's owners, but the business also relies on charter boat business for the purchase of fuel, bait, and ice. They sell over one million gallons of fuel each year to commercial and sportfishing boats.

With the exception of a few resorts and retail businesses, the dock is one of the only full-time, year-round employers in Montauk, employing between four and six dock workers, a secretary, and a manager. All of the employees live in Montauk or East Hampton, but housing is a problem due to the high cost of living in the area. Labor turnover is low due to the ability of the dock to provide equitable wages and predictable pay throughout the year. The dock does compete with the landscaping and construction companies for labor, especially from among immigrant populations. All of the dock workers are immigrants from Central and South America, and many are recruited through connections with kin and friends who have already established roots in the area. The dock instituted a novel literacy program that brings volunteers from the local library to the dock who provide English lessons to the workers on company time. Winter is one of the busiest times of the year for the dock and the dock hands may work 60-65 hours a week when draggers are landing large volumes of squid and whiting. The activity at the dock slows in the summer for the draggers, but picks up for the small pinhookers. The dock moves one

truck load of 6,000 boxes each week during its busiest seasons. The trucking is subcontracted.⁹

While the dock makes some income from the sale of fuel, ice, and bait, the bulk of the dock's profit comes from the shipment of the boxes to market. The dock charges a per box shipping fee that is subtracted from the fishermen's return on the sale of fish. The fee pays for the box, pack-out service, ice, and shipping. Fishermen sell and truck their catch to dozens of buyers at Fulton Fish Market in New York City, as well as squid processing plants across the country. The marketing decisions are left to the fishermen, but the dock will check prices and make calls to dealers. The dock's primary species are squid and whiting because of low state quotas on Mid-Atlantic species such as fluke, scup, sea bass, bluefish, monkfish, and dogfish. The dock's capacity is roughly 125,000 pounds daily, but they are not operating at this level due to quota restrictions and other regulatory measures that limit supply.

The other packing facility in Montauk has been in operation since the 1940s. Current management has run the facility since 1988. The business is a packing house and freight forwarder, not a fish buyer. The infrastructure includes a bait freezer, cooler, and machinery such as staplers and forklifts. The dock's daily capacity is approximately two trailer loads, of 550 cartons each, but they are not operating at full capacity due to regulations that have reduced supply. Tilefish, which are landed year-round, represent at least 65% of the dock's business. This dock packs the landings of the four tilefish longliners of Montauk. They also pack the product of five inshore draggers, ten pinhookers, one gillnetter, one conch potter, and one tuna/sword longliner from North Hampton. Fluke, squid, and butterfish are important summer species, butterfish is also important in the fall, and flounder is landed here in the winter. Regulations on striped bass, fluke, and scup have been detrimental to the supply that comes across this dock. The inshore draggers that still supply some fluke, but the large draggers that primarily target squid and whiting do not land product here. In past summers, the dock used to pack between four and six longliners, but regulations on tuna and swordfish have all but eliminated this supply.

Presently the operation is a "one man show". The manager has one part-time helper. Prior to the tilefish FMP which went into effect in November 2001, the business was operated by two partners and employed two full-time workers. Turnover among employees is high because the business finds it hard to compete with landscape and construction jobs that pay as much as \$20/hour. The one part-time employee works 35-40 hour days in the summer, but is cut back in the fall and winter when the supply is at its lowest.

⁹ In New York, commercial boats pack fish in boxes while at sea. At this dock, the boxes are stapled together with 3 industrial staplers in a loft which is called "box purgatory," where each dock worker is required to work for a time. They purchase over \$4000 worth of staples for the boxes alone. The empty boxes are loaded into the hold of boats, packed at sea, unloaded at the dock, and put on pallets that go into the trailers for trucking. The dock's best single day of shipping occurred one New Year's day during which six truck loads were shipped (over 1/4 million pounds).

One other dock in Montauk provides services to commercial fishermen. This business is a wholesale seafood distribution center that also includes a retail seafood market. It operates the only ice machine in Montauk, supplying commercial and sportfishing boats. The business, which has been in operation for roughly 60 years, no longer packs boats or ships product on consignment. The lack of volume and instability in supply makes this dimension of the business unprofitable. Only 20% of the dock's product is local. This includes lobster, striped bass, flounder and a few other species. The tuna, shrimp, and most all other products are imported. The local longlining fleet that used to supply swordfish and tuna is all but gone. In addition, the need to provide customers with a consistent, reliable supply is hampered by regulatory environments that make local product supply very unpredictable. The operation ceased filleting fish for wholesale when regulations put a strangle hold on supply. "There was no local, consistent supply." Another problem with local suppliers is the fact that draggers catch fish of all sizes. Purchasing a "boat run" composed of varying size fish receives a lower price at market due to consumer tastes that demand a specific size and quantity. The operation buys frozen blocks internationally and sells them to local restaurants and regional restaurants and markets. Iced fresh seafood is sold to local and regional restaurants and through the retail market. The business buys from as many as 100 different pinhookers as well as six to eight lobstermen.

The business operates all year, but summer is the most active season, during which they employ up to twenty people for both counter/retail work and labor/wholesale jobs. Many of the employees are seasonal immigrants from Latin America, and European countries including Ireland and Poland. The business provides housing for a limited number of employees who need it, and rent is subtracted from their pay.

The infrastructure for the commercial fishing fleet of Montauk has declined in recent years, but is still considered to be a vital dimension of the area's economy. A local marine supply shop did go out of business and some note that there are fewer commercial fishing supplies on marina shelves in recent years, necessitating more mail orders for gear. Of much greater concern is the decline in the number of packing facilities. The two docks that still pack product are not making what they used to, but are said to be making ends meet. Maintaining these packing facilities is considered by many to be of utmost importance for the continued viability of the Montauk fishing fleet. The town of East Hampton recently renovated the commercial docks, which are also considered to be essential to the fleet. While some draggers have a difficult time finding storage for nets, gear storage is primarily a problem for the lobstermen, whose pots are not allowed on town docks and other private docks. Filling of the Inlet has been a problem in the past. Fishermen and members of the town council attempted to put pressure on the Army Corps of Engineers to dredge the inlet, but it was not until a boat ran aground in January 2000 that the gears were set in motion.

Economic Networks

The economic networks of the commercial fishing industry centered in Montauk extend well beyond the local packing facilities, boat owners, captains, and crew. Many other

local, regional, national, and international businesses are tied into the economic activities of Montauk's commercial fishing industry. Commercial fishermen who were asked to detail their economic ties to other businesses provided information that reveals the scope of these networks. Many fishermen obtain boat fuel at the local packing houses, but some will fuel up in Rhode Island or Connecticut as well. Ice is obtained from a local dock, but some fishermen make their own. One dragger estimated spending \$2000 per week on ice alone. Many fishermen do their own welding but some rely on local welders who are skilled in boat repair. Large boats haul out at Promet Marine Services Corporation in Providence, RI and have major work done at Rhode Island Engine Repair. There are no marine supply shops in Montauk, so fishermen obtain electronics and navigational equipment from outside of the immediate area. Some purchase electronics from Seatronics and Hampton Electronics in Hampton Bays, NY, others from Point Judith Electronics, in RI, or through mail order. The primary suppliers of fishing gear are located in Rhode Island, but many fishermen patronize Gearwork in Riverhead, NY, and the local marinas. Safety at sea equipment is similarly purchased from businesses in Rhode Island such as Life Raft and Survival Inc. in Portsmouth, and a host of other businesses such as Hamilton Marine in Maine and Consumers Marine and Electronics in New Jersey. Provisions for voyages are primarily obtained from the local IGA grocery store in Montauk. One dragger captain estimates spending \$40,000 a year on groceries at the IGA for fishing trips. Another informant estimated that each of five boats at one dock alone spend between \$300 and \$400 per trip, or between \$1500 and \$2000 per month. Over the course of four months, these boats will spend roughly \$30,000 to \$40,000 in groceries at the local IGA. The company estimates that it receives the regular business of eight to twelve fishing vessels, each of which may spend between \$800 and \$1,200 per trip. Commercial fishing purchases are especially important to the business during the winter time when the tourist trade is nil. Provisions are also obtained in New England ports such as Narragansett when boats are targeting groundfish. There are a number of local banks that do provide loans to fishermen, but as one informant noted, "no one is jumping to finance boats." One of the most fisherman-friendly banks is said to be Bridgehampton National. Suffolk County National and Farm Credit are considered to be less willing to lend in recent years. Insurance is purchased from a variety of companies including Island Wide Marine Agency in New York, Smithwick and Mariners in New Bedford, MA, the Point Club in Rhode Island. Depending on the scale of operations, some fishermen keep their own books with the help of their wives or else employ personal accountants.

These are just a few of the immediate networks that link fishermen to wider markets. They do not include, for example, the product distribution links among the industry participants in Montauk, and wholesale outlets, retail markets, restaurants, bait shops, and cutting houses. Most of the product coming across the dock is sold on consignment to dealers at the Fulton Fish Market but some squid, for example, is also sent to processors such as Ruggerio and Top Catch in New York, or others in New Jersey. While Montauk fishermen typically send their product to market via the two primary packing houses in town, some land fish in New England at docks such as Deep Sea in Narragansett, RI or else at other New England auction houses. Baymen in the area have economic ties to two

other small-scale packing houses outside of Montauk - Stuart's Seafood in Amagansett, and the Seafood Shop in Wainscott, NY.

Managers at the packing houses described a full range of local businesses to which they are economically tied, including welders, banks, grocery stores, home trades, refrigeration, maintenance, and restaurants. They are also key nodes in the economic network of recreational and charter boat fishermen who rely on these businesses for fuel, ice, and bait. The infrastructure is connected to wider networks that include fuel companies, packing material suppliers, and trucking firms.

Social Networks and Community Relations

Montauk is a village and many consider it to be, quintessentially, a fishing village. The sheer number of commercial and recreational boats, commercial fishing families, sportfishermen, and fishing related businesses are an overwhelming presence in the village's economic and social life. Local businesses throughout the village display photographs and other memorabilia celebrating the maritime past and present of Montauk. Expressive culture related to fishing is also found at community events such as the annual Blessing of the Fleet. Every June, a flotilla of boats, both commercial and recreational, participates in the event which features prayers for health and safety at sea conducted by a priest, minister, and rabbi; a procession of boats out of and back into the harbor; and a commemoration of local fishermen lost at sea with the laying of wreaths on the water.

Montauk also features a memorial dedicated to East End commercial fishermen lost at sea. The bronze monument, sculpted by Malcolm Frazier, is an eight foot fisherman pulling in a net over the bow of a dory. The names of over one hundred men lost at sea are engraved on the monument's pedestal. The idea for a memorial was sparked by the tragic loss of crew aboard the Anne Louise in 1993. The monument is situated at Montauk Point, between Montauk Light and the cliff edge on park property. According to the Hampton Star, fishermen were upset that the public could not access the memorial without paying the \$4.50 entrance fee for the Lighthouse Museum. Someone reportedly dumped a load of fish outside the gate in protest (<http://archive.easthamptonstar.com/ehquery/20000106/edit2.htm>). This is one example of the strong feelings that local community members have about the fishing heritage of Montauk and the East End more broadly.

A recent ruling on a federal lawsuit brought by conservation groups against the National Marine Fisheries Service prompted a display of solidarity and protest that exemplifies the community's connection to commercial fishing. The April 26, 2002 decision of U.S. District Judge Gladys Kessler implemented measures designed to curb over fishing of groundfish stocks that many considered to be draconian and potentially devastating to fishing communities.¹⁰ On June 15, 2002, commercial fishermen from Montauk joined

¹⁰ In May 2001, the Conservation Law Foundation and three other environmental groups filed a lawsuit against the National Marine Fisheries Service for failing to enforce the Sustainable Fisheries Act of 1996 and the federal law requiring the restoration of groundfish populations (CLF, et al. v. Evans, Civil. No. 00-

forces with local community members, representatives, and fishermen from other ports in New York and Rhode Island to protest the decision by Judge Kessler. This rally was the fifth in a series of gatherings among fishermen in New England and the Mid-Atlantic. It was also attended by East Hampton Township council members, the town supervisor, a U.S. congressman, a representative from Senator Hillary Clinton's office, and a buyer at the Fulton Fish Market, each of whom expressed their support for the industry, fishing families, and the Montauk fishing community.

The rally brought together different gear groups that are typically less cohesive in Montauk. While the groundfish ruling was most threatening to the offshore Montauk draggers, other gear groups participated in the event, demonstrating their support for one another. According to informants, Montauk fishermen get along well enough with one another, but usually socialize within their own gear groups. Like communities elsewhere, Montauk is marked by both cooperation and conflict. There are rifts in the fishing community, such as the differences between part-time pinhookers and other fulltime fishermen. Fulltime commercial fishermen are critical of the large number of part-time hook and line fishermen who, they feel, eat away at a limited quota that is more appropriately landed by those who depend on the sea to make a living. Hook and line fishermen may, in turn, be critical of the discard associated with the trawler fleet. Sometimes, differences are based on gear conflict. One fisherman noted that there are occasional gear conflicts between, for example, fixed gear lobster potters and draggers. Long Island sound is notorious for gear conflict among lobstermen. However, differences such as these do not threaten the foundation of the community. As one fisherman asserted, most fishermen, regardless of gear type, would stand behind each other if there was a need. Another explained that, "being at sea forces people to work together." Other fishermen agreed that the fishing grounds bring people together, along with similar concerns and interests. While it is said that there is not much sharing of technology, fishermen do share information and talk on the radio while at sea. This does not necessarily translate into socialization on land. One fisherman explained that good times tend to bring people together and at one point in time some of the fishermen in the same gear group would join together for a Christmas party. Much of the socialization is conducted at the docks. Liar's Saloon is also known as a commercial fishermen's bar.

The popular and oft ill-founded public image of commercial fishermen as self-interested, rapacious individualists is countered by the success of the tilefishing fleet of Montauk, members of which have been able to work together to prevent derby-style fishing following the implementation of the tilefish FMP. The four tilefishing boats in Montauk are each placed in "tier one" of the tilefish FMP, which is allocated 66% of the total catch. These boats could conceivably work as hard as they could to get the largest slice of that 66%, but the owners came together and devised an informal plan for sharing the quota in order to keep all the boats in operation throughout the year, and the market

1134 GK (D.D.C., December 28, 2001)). The lawsuit charged that NMFS has not protected cod, haddock and 12 other species from over fishing, in part, because fishermen were not being adequately required to limit discard. Kessler ruled that the NMFS was in violation of federal law by not working swiftly enough to counter the pressure on groundfish stocks (Holland 2002).

supplied consistently with product. Even the fisheries managers expected them to derby fish, but they cooperated in spreading the quota out over the four quarters such that 25% is available in the 4th quarter.

The commercial fishing and sportfishing industries are often pitted against each other on issues of fisheries management. This sometimes translates into strained relationships among commercial and recreational fishermen in Montauk. While most contend that confrontation is rare, there are occasional expressions of conflict at sea. Commercial fishermen contend that recreational boats may anchor up on lobster pots to fish for tuna, or will "hang on the ends" of commercial fishing gear. Some commercial fishermen criticized the lack of respect that some recreational fishermen have toward commercial fishing gear. One issue on which the groups are divided relates to quota allocation and accountability. According to one commercial fisherman, there is no accountability among recreational fishermen - if they catch more fluke than the quota allows, the amount is subtracted from both recreational and commercial quota the following year. Another sore spot involves the allocation of food fish permits to client-based sportfishermen who earn at least 50% of their income from the water. Some commercial fishermen want to restrict the distribution of food fish permits to those who harvest fish for a living, throughout the year. With so many boats using food fish permits, the quota is spread between far too many fishermen. Despite these differences, commercial and recreational fishermen are said to get along on shore as neighbors.

Commercial fishing is a respected dimension of Montauk's social and economic life, and fishermen are said to get along well with other members of the community. It is difficult to find a resident who is not related to, or friends with, someone involved in the commercial fishing industry. One estimate places the number of commercial fishing families in Montauk at 300. Montauk is a small village in which people of all professions send their children to school together, live next to one another, and interact regularly. Some may have a poor opinion of fishermen, but the majority respects the trade and the work that fishermen do for the community. Fishermen are involved in community events, government offices, the volunteer fire department, and many other local functions. Occasional disputes occur, such as complaints being filed by a restaurant owner over the noise and smell associated with a nearby dock, but these have been rare. Of greater concern to fishermen is the general state of ignorance among the public at large, who, they say, are fed lies by the environmental lobbies vilifying commercial fishing. Greater public awareness of fishing practice is considered to be a necessity for the success of the industry.

Discussion: Community/fisheries dependency and engagement

Participants in the commercial fishing industry are unequivocal in representing Montauk as a fishing community that depends on commercial fishing for the community's social and economic well-being. As one fisherman described it, "Montauk is a fish-oriented place." While the economy has become more and more dependent on tourism and second-home ownership, commercial fishing brought in an estimated \$34 million in ex-vessel revenue to the town of East Hampton in 1999 (Horne Rose LLC et al. 2003).

Statistics show that Montauk experiences a large influx of seasonal visitors. According to the 2000 census, 67% of housing units are vacant and 63% of housing units are for seasonal, recreational, or occasional use. While Montauk has only 15% of the Town's year round population, it accommodates 36% of the town's seasonal population (ibid.). Employment data demonstrate the importance of seasonal tourism to the community.

The top three industry employment categories in 2000 include arts/entertainment/recreation/accommodation/food services at 20%; construction at 19%; and retail trade at 10%. Employment in agriculture, forestry, and fisheries accounted for 6.1% (103 individuals) in 2002, down from 7.71% (139 individuals) in 1990. The seasonal tourist trade is not, however, antithetical to the operation of the commercial fishing industry. The identity of Montauk as a laid-back fishing village is part of what makes it so attractive to tourists and the community is concerned about preserving that identity. Furthermore, the operation of the commercial fishing industry throughout the winter keeps the local economy moving, providing employment when many businesses are closed for the season.

East Hampton Township has recognized the importance of the commercial fishing industry to Montauk and the town as a whole. To begin with, the Town Board organized a "Fishing Committee" to represent fishing industry interests in the development of the town's comprehensive plan. The 2003 plan states that commercial fishing is a significant and historic industry in East Hampton. Goal number seven of the plan is to "support and retain traditional local resource based fishing and agriculture industries that practice environmentally sensitive methods of operation" (ibid.). The plan also recognizes concerns of the fishing industry, which include: the Local Waterfront Revitalization Plan; support facilities and infrastructure for the fishing industry; waterway management including dredging; maintenance of Montauk Inlet; town owned waterfront assets; storage space for fishing gear; beach access; harbor management; stormwater abatement and road runoff; and state and federal regulations.

The town has demonstrated its commitment to commercial fishing in Montauk in a number of ways, including the recent \$1 million renovation of the two municipal commercial fishing docks in Montauk. The town has also passed resolutions in support of commercial fishing interests including a resolution against state by state fluke quotas. Representatives from East Hampton Township have also lobbied to expedite the dredging of the Montauk Inlet, and attended the rally in support of fishermen against the Kessler decision on groundfish conservation. The town is also said to support one of the local docks that is seeking to make improvements to the property.

Others, however, point to strict zoning laws as an indication of the town's lack of support for the commercial industry. One dock owner explained that the town is attempting to limit growth by creating obstacles that prevent making improvements to the property. Spending the money necessary for plans and proposals is too great a risk in light of the potential for the plans to be declined. "Look at the harbor area - it is blighted with run down homes and businesses." The town is also accused of avoiding the steps necessary to develop affordable housing in order to prevent the settlement of immigrant labor. In

fairness, the comprehensive plan acknowledges the housing crisis and makes affordable housing one of the most urgent goals. According to a representative of East Hampton Township, the town has funded a study of the dock area around Lake Montauk that is designed to discover ways of bringing in affordable housing and improved infrastructure, including the sewage system, without diminishing the working waterfront and character of the area.

In short, the commercial fishing fleet is an integral component of the social, economic, and cultural life of Montauk. The East Hampton Star publishes regular columns devoted to fisheries issues and has demonstrated support for the industry over the years. Residents recognize the historical importance of the industry, and the role it has played in the development of the community and its identity. Commercial fishing families participate in the social and political functions of the village and township, and proudly promote fishing as a valuable way of life. The dedication to this way of life is palpable among the Montauk fishermen, who time and again expressed their commitment to its preservation.

B. Recreational Fishing

History and Current Description

Sportfishing in Montauk has a long, storied past. The early days of fishing were inaugurated by Arthur Benson, a wealthy New Yorker who bought a great deal of land and established a hunting and fishing lodge by Montauk Point. This retreat catered to the upper class, bringing well-to-do business men to the area. One of these men, Austin Corbin, brought the Long Island Railroad to Montauk in 1895, which quickly became a key to the development of Montauk's charter and party boat fleet. The "Fishermen's Special," as the train route was known, delivered recreational fishermen from New York City by the car-load right to the docks at Fort Pond Bay. Here, they could get aboard party boats, fish all day and return aboard the train with their catch later that day. Montauk soon became known for producing trophy fish after William Morgan landed a 76 pound striped bass at the Point in 1901. Montauk's reputation as a sportfishing destination grew throughout the early 1900s and the Fort Pond settlement burgeoned into a year-round community that included rooming houses for fishermen. Large party boats, between 50 and 100 feet long, began operating after the railroad was established. Commercial baymen started to employ their scallop boats and other small vessels in the sportfishing industry, catering to summer fishing parties

Sportfishing in Montauk experienced growth and change in the midst of the development spawned by Carl Fisher, who purchased much of the land in 1925. His vision of Montauk as the "Miami Beach of the North" resulted in the dredging of Lake Montauk, the creation of Montauk Inlet, and the establishment of a deep water harbor and yacht club. This protected area, known as Montauk Harbor, soon attracted the fleet from Fort Pond Bay. It became the focal point of the recreational fishing fleet after the Hurricane of 1938, which destroyed much of the infrastructure at the exposed, Fort Pond Bay

community. During this period, many Montauk draggers adapted their boats for chartering and joined the sportfishing fleet, putting clients on swordfish. In 1932, Montauk attracted over 5,000 customers. This number grew to over 20,000 in 1934 when the Long Island Railroad began daily routes from New York and Brooklyn (Matthiessen 1986:91). The area was promoted through the work of sportfishing writer S. Kip Farrington of East Hampton. By the late 1930s, the Montauk sportfishing fleet was known for offshore fishing and its catches of swordfish, marlin, and bluefin tuna from the Gulf Stream waters.

Much of the tourist infrastructure that was developed in the years following the collapse of Carl Fisher's dreams for Montauk catered to recreational fishermen. The majority of accommodations, restaurants, marinas, and other businesses were geared to the everyday fisherman. In the Post-World War II period, Lake Montauk became crowded with marinas and sportfishing boats and the village became known as the "Fishing Capital of the World." Party boats continued to operate from what was known as the "Fishangri-la dock" at Fort Pond Bay, which once again became the terminus of the Long Island Railroad's daily Fisherman's Special excursions (the price of which paid for both the train fare and the boat fee). According to one account, this was a time of plenty when "more big marlin, tuna, swordfish and shark were taken then, than any other time in this community's history" (Montauk-online.com 2000b). This may also account for the unofficial name of the area along the harbor front where the charter boats were tied - "Murderer's Row." During this period, the elite Deep Sea Club was founded, and began sponsoring annual swordfishing tournaments that were widely popular. Shark fishing was pioneered at this time by a local captain named Frank Mundus, who used a "secret chum" to draw the sharks. By the 1970s, shark fishing was catching on in other Atlantic ports and shark tournaments were being held by a local marina.¹¹

Today, Montauk remains one of the largest sportfishing ports on the East Coast. Hordes of fishermen are drawn to Montauk. The unique location concentrates forage and game fish. The nearby Gulf Stream creates warm water eddies that spin off from the stream, bringing migrating fish within striking distance from Long Island. The nutrient runoff from rivers like the Hudson drains into the offshore canyons, enriching the foundation of the food chain. During the spring and fall, the rips around Montauk Point are rich with forage and migrating game fish like striped bass and bluefish. Montauk offers access to a great variety of inshore and offshore species. Anglers in Montauk have submitted 149 applications for game fish records over the years to the International Game Fish Association (IGFA) and currently hold 31 IGFA records.¹² For boaters and the for-hire fleet there are 14 major marinas in Lake Montauk and a handful of smaller marinas that, together, provide an estimated 1,600 slips. The Montauk Captain's and Boatman's Association has approximately 100 members from among the area charter and party boat operations. A representative from the association reports that this number has remained fairly constant over the past 15 years, a span during which business has leveled off but remained robust. In addition to the for-hire fleet, Montauk is a Mecca of surf fishermen who come to revel in the "fall blitzes" of rockfish and bluefish.

¹¹ For more on the history of shark fishing in Montauk, see Drumm 1997 and Tuma 1996.

¹² According to IGFA records, September 8, 2003.

A local author indicated that the Montauk sportfishing industry truly revolves around the striped bass. While the offshore fishing opportunities are pursued by clients onboard charter boats, and inshore species like porgy are targeted by party boats, there are many more private boat owners, charters, and surf fishermen that run inshore for striped bass. "People are most passionate about striped bass." This passion for striped bass can be traced to the early days of fishing and the trophy that William Morgan caught in 1901. The decline of the striped bass fishery brought a great deal of attention to East Hampton with clashes between the sportfishing lobby and commercial fishermen in the mid-1980s (see Matthiessen 1986). The striped bass crash coincided with some of the best tuna fishing ever witnessed in Montauk. Large fish were being taken close to land. "From the West Bank of the Butterfish Hole, roughly fifteen miles from The Lighthouse eastward to the Tuna Bank about the same distance southeast of Block Island, every weekend would find two or three fleets consisting of hundreds of boats, anchored up, throwing butterfish in the water and hauling yellowfins out of it" (Kelly n.d.). Since the stock's rebound, striped bass fishing has once again taken center stage. Offshore, tuna fishing and shark fishing are still popular, and the faster boats of the current fleet are able to fish the canyons out to 100 miles. Inshore, sea bass and porgy have made significant comebacks, bringing renewed business for many party boat operations that can now offer overnight wreck fishing trips during the winter. In addition, there is a rising emphasis on flats-boat guide services for light tackle and fly anglers in the back bays. While striped bass may account for the largest number of angler trips, all of the game fish species that can be caught near Montauk are said to be important for the industry as a whole due to the seasonal availability of each.

Seasonal Round

The seasonal round among sportfishermen in Montauk varies according to gear type and preferences, but the overall round can be illustrated in the following fashion. In January a few fishermen target cod, pollock, and ling further offshore. Cod has declined over the years, but ling has become more desirable. The same species hold during the months of February and March. In April, there are better conditions for the pursuit of these species and the area docks and recreational boats are getting into action. Striped bass catch and release fishing begins in April and a short run of mackerel often appears at this time. Some will target mackerel to use as bait for shark later in the year. Some anglers may target fluke in Lake Montauk in April and May, which is a relatively new fishery for Montauk. Fluke fishing was never very significant in Montauk, but of late it has been a boon to the recreational fishing industry of the area because it can be combined with striped bass fishing and all ages can participate. In May, the large fluke are in the ocean, along the south shore where they can be caught with squid/killie bait combination or jigs. May also witnesses the arrival of more striped bass and bluefish which are caught by boaters and surf casters primarily with lures. Blackfish may also be caught in the spring, along with cod, pollock and ling. June is also an excellent month for striped bass, bluefish, and fluke. Porgy fishing on board party boats is popular in May and June, and pelagic shark fishing may also begin in June. Species like thresher and mako shark are sought by private recreational craft and charter boats using chum. In July, shark fishing

between 12 and 30 miles is popular, along with striped bass fishing and bluefish. Tuna may start to show up depending on the water temperature. The summer fluke fishery has become a huge draw for shore-bound and small-boat fishermen. Montauk Lake and Montauk Inlet are popular grounds for fluke. The cod have moved to colder water by mid-summer. Montauk experiences the doldrums in August when the shark move Down East to the Dumping Grounds and the Grand Banks. Anglers can still find tuna, but may have to troll rather than chunk in order to find them. Chunking for tuna became popular some 15 years ago, but it is dependent on water temperatures. Porgy and fluke are also caught in August. September is a very active month when bait fish and predators are on the move. The game fish get more aggressive at this time and anglers can catch a host of species including tuna, shark, bluefish, and striped bass. Surf casting heats up in September and lasts into November depending on the weather. Most surf casters are targeting striped bass, but will take advantage of bluefish blitzes. Offshore canyon fishing for bigeye, yellowfin, and giant tuna peaks in September and many charters pursue these species. Offshore fishermen catch marlin incidentally. While blue marlin has been good in recent years, white marlin and swordfish have not rebounded for Montauk area fishermen. Swordfish are caught, however, especially during overnight canyon trips, chunking with squid. Most boats stay inshore during October due to the unpredictable conditions and the abundance of fish in close to shore, including striped bass, bluefish, false albacore, porgy, and blackfish. By November the offshore season is finished, but large striped bass, bluefish, porgy and blackfish still provide action. Most surf casters hang up their gear in December, but some stripers can still be caught. The majority of charters pack it in by Thanksgiving, but cod, porgy, and blackfish keep some of the operations in business during the winter.

The charter and party boats of Montauk concentrate a lot of activity in the rips around Montauk Point and Eastern Gardeners Bay, as well as offshore depending on the season. According to a representative from the charter boat fleet of Montauk, three or four boats run out to Block Island and Cox's Ledge between January and April to pursue cod and ling. The cod landings have declined due to over harvest and so this is not a very large fishery for recreational boats. More boats start operating in April when cod and groundfishing can be supplemented with winter flounder that can be caught in the harbor. A few boats will also fish for mackerel in the month of April, but the run is very unpredictable and short. In May, charters are booking trips for striped bass caught with artificials or drifting live eels at night around Montauk Point. Charters may also catch fluke around the Point, and sea bass and bluefish around wrecks in May. These species are pursued in June, which is also a good month for the beginning of offshore shark fishing and party boat porgy fishing. The same species will be caught through July, but added to the mix will be trolling and chunking for tuna 20-60 miles offshore. Offshore fishing for tuna, shark, and incidental billfish continues through the month of August for many charters. September is similar, but bluefish and striped bass start to show up once again. October is a great month for striped bass charters, along with bluefish, sea bass, and porgy. It is also when offshore tuna charters typically wrap-up. Charters operating in November may target porgy, sea bass, and blackfish depending on the weather and availability of striped bass, which ends December 15.

A party boat captain described a similar pattern of activity for the party boat fleet. January through March is focused on cod, 20-50 miles away using clam as bait. Flounder picks up in March around Block Island and continues into June. Party boats may also target mackerel in April with jigs or clams between five and 15 miles from shore. Striped bass fishing is good in May around the Point and Block Island. In June party boats may target flounder, fluke, sea bass, porgy, or striped bass. In July it is much the same, but the night fishing with eels for striped bass has really picked up in recent years when the weather is good. August is similar, but there are approximately five party boats in Montauk that will make two-day trips offshore for tuna during August. This pattern holds until October when striped bass and blues become the focal species, around the Point. Striped bass continue for party boats, as for others, into November but they also focus on blackfish and sea bass. It should be noted that there are a few party boats in Montauk that target porgy throughout much of the season.

Overall, you can find someone fishing throughout the year in Montauk, but the winter and early spring are the slowest times due to the lack of flounder and cod. Late spring witnesses the arrival of migrating striped bass and fluke that come around Montauk Point and enter the bays for the summer. May is an excellent month due to the arrival of these migrating game fish. This early run, which is composed of big fish including large stripers and what are called "runner" bluefish, typically lasts into June. The spring run of weakfish is starting to comeback, which offers opportunities for boaters and shore anglers in the back bays. The area experiences a late summer due to ocean currents and the Gulf Stream eddies that keep the water warm through the fall. Striped bass can be caught through November and even up until Christmas, but the heaviest concentration of activity takes place between May and into the fall. Surf fishermen find the spring and the fall to be the best times for locating voracious schools of striped bass and bluefish. Fishermen are often packed shoulder to shoulder along shoreline around the Point during these times.

Fishing Grounds

The diversity of fish that are caught by Montauk sportfishermen is rivaled only by the diversity of the fishing grounds associated with this port. As aforementioned, Montauk is within striking distance of offshore canyons in the Gulf Stream. There are numerous near-shore fishing grounds associated with wrecks, bathymetric contours, structure, and water temperatures. Many of these spots are named, such as the Butterfish Hole, Coxes Ledge, East Grounds, Block Island Tuna Grounds, and the Dumps. There is a great variety of inshore fishing spots around Montauk, most notably the rips around Montauk Point. Anglers fish on both the south shore (Atlantic Ocean side) and the north shore (Block Island Sound side) of the Point. Others pursue fish in the bays and inshore waters including Lake Montauk, Gardiner's Bay, and the Peconics Bay system. Most shore based fishing is concentrated around Montauk Point, and along the northern beach from Montauk Inlet to the Point. Shore bound fishermen also use the newly-built East Hampton Town fishing pier on Fort Pond Bay.

Angler/Clientele Description

Montauk draws myriad recreational fishermen from all walks of life and all categories of interest. During the early days of Montauk's rise as a sportfishing destination, the village saw the likes of Ernest Hemingway, S. Kip Farrington, and Zane Grey who, among other elites, sought billfish and tuna offshore in the 1920s and 1930s. In later years, working folk came aboard the Fisherman's Special to fish from party boats for porgy and sea bass. After World War II, the clientele was very much oriented towards "meat fishing," bringing to the dock whatever they caught. The 'Murderer's Row' of charter boats would bring back loads of fish for their clients, including shark, which were then killed not for consumption, but due to public misperceptions. In more recent years, there has been a change in the attitude of many recreational fishermen who go to Montauk. While there are still those who wish to fill a cooler, many have turned to catch and release practices. Like elsewhere, this difference is largely influenced by socioeconomics and culture.

Among the categories of Montauk anglers are those who come to fish aboard charters or party boats, private boat owners, and surf fishermen. There are further distinctions within each of these categories. The private boat owners range from wealthy to blue-collar, but most are middle class. Many keep their boats at local marinas and drive to Montauk from the western Long Island during the summer. This category includes the second homeowners who live the majority of the year elsewhere on Long Island. Marina owners and managers in Montauk stated that there is a large transient clientele base from Connecticut, Rhode Island, Massachusetts, and New York from the Long Island Sound ports. One marina reported that 40% of their customers are transients and 75% of their customers come from New York and Connecticut. Another reported that 60-65% come from Nassau County, NY, Connecticut, and New Jersey, while only 10% come from East Hampton. They also get occasional transients from Maine, Rhode Island, or upstate New York. Many sportfishing boats come from Connecticut because Montauk is well located for provisioning and fueling. The manager of a different marina explained that they cater primarily to high socioeconomic status clientele who come out on the weekends in the summer, but fall and spring are dominated by average recreational fishermen. There are also fishermen from New York and New Jersey who trailer small boats to Montauk, stay in motels, and use local launch facilities. In addition, kayak fishing in the back bays has become very popular in recent years.

A representative from the charter boat fleet described the demographics of their clientele. Ethnically, the majority of clients are white but they do draw from Asian, Hispanic, and African American populations. Clients range in age, but the industry has a saying that, "you see the young guys until they get married and then you don't see them again until they are in their 50s and their kids are out of school." In other words there is a gap in age between the late 20s and early 50s. The majority of the clientele are middle class, but the socio-economic status has some bearing on the preferred species and fishing methods. For example, the wealthier clientele prefers offshore billfishing and the pursuit of big game on light tackle. Socioeconomic and cultural elitism tends to mark the use of fly tackle as well. Saltwater fly fishing is a relatively new phenomenon according to one local author. Within the last five years interest in this dimension of sportfishing has burgeoned as wealthy clients hire local "flats" style boat guides to site cast for blues and

stripers in Gardiner's Bay, or else pursue false "albies" and bonita by the Point in the fall. He attributes this interest to the wealth that is driving consumption, "These are the people with sports utility vehicles, they spend thousands of dollars on equipment, and they will pay \$200-\$400 for a guide to go for a half a day of catch and release fishing." Among African American clientele, porgy, cod, and other bottom fish are favored as food fish. Asian charter clients are also said to favor bottom fish, as well as tuna. Geographically, an estimated 90-95% of clients among the Montauk charter fleet come from Long Island and New York metropolitan area, and live in Rockland, Westchester, Nassau, and Suffolk counties. Clients are attracted through advertising in trade journals such as Long Island Fisherman and Noreast Saltwater Magazine, but word of mouth is considered to be the most critical source of advertising. It is estimated that 80% of the clientele among Montauk charters are repeat customers. This is because Montauk is not like other tourist towns where people go and then decide to book a charter. People go to Montauk to fish. One representative from the charter industry estimated that only 5% of the clientele is attributed to vacationers who decide to take a day to go fishing.

A representative from the party boat industry based in Montauk explained that they receive business from a large range of demographic sectors, but much of it is family oriented. In the past, the party boat operations were favored primarily by "meat hunters who caught fish for sale and subsistence in New York." More recently, the increasingly restrictive size minimums and bag limits have eliminated some of the "meat" oriented fishermen and encouraged the development of a conservation ethic among the party boat clientele. "When it first started there was resentment but people are more used to it now." The industry also receives the business of more women and children in recent years. Socioeconomic status of party boat clientele is said to range across the spectrum from unemployed people to doctors. Ethnicity also varies according to species targeted. Some porgy fishing charter boats in Montauk, for example, attract a large African American clientele. According to one party boat captain, the clients on party boats are often in Montauk on a family vacation and so spend more time and money in town than the average charter client. Like the charter operations, party boats are said to rely heavily on repeat customers. The difference is said to be the frequency of return. "A good charter customer comes back four times a year, while a good party boat customer comes back thirty times a year." Most of the clients are said to come from Long Island, New York City, and Northern New Jersey.

Shore based fishing in Montauk is extremely popular. This category of fishing practice is dominated by surf casters who typically employ spinning tackle and artificial lures in the pursuit of striped bass and bluefish during the spring and fall runs. Most surf casters are said to be blue-collar to middle class, and Caucasian. Surf casting is not a monolithic set of similar practices. There are significant differences among fishermen within this category. Most surf fishermen are equipped with wading apparel, spinning tackle, and artificial lures. There are, however, fly fishing surf fishermen, as well as those who defy categorization due to the extreme nature of their fishing practice. They are surf casters in that they fish in the surf, but they are not quite shore-based. These anglers suit up in wetsuits and swim out beyond the shore with their gear, locate submerged rocks, and fish in the midst of the schools of fish. Some have forsaken terra firma entirely and simply

float in the water, drifting eels or working lures. The tendency to be towed by fish has prompted some to call this practice "skishing" - fish skiing (see Field and Stream, September 2003).

Crew Description

There are roughly 75 charter boats and eight party boats operating out of Montauk. The Montauk Boatmen's and Captain's Association has a membership that includes over 100 licensed captains. The charter boats range from small flats-style boats that offer fly fishing and light tackle trips to 70 foot yachts that accommodate large parties for offshore fishing. The majority of the charter fleet consists of 'six-packs,' licensed to carry up to six passengers. The party boats are in the one hundred foot size range, and carry dozens of anglers. According to Vessel Trip Report data, there were 49 federally-permitted for-hire vessels that landed 1,379 trips in Montauk in 2001. Forty three of these boats listed Montauk as the principal port and made a total of 1,324 trips. The six other boats came from ports in North Carolina, Connecticut, Massachusetts, Rhode Island and New York (2). Among the federally permitted boats listing Montauk as principal port that landed trips in Montauk during 2001, nine were listed as "party" and 39 were listed as "charter." These numbers sum to greater than the 43 boats that reported trips in 2001, which means that a few boats reported as more than one category. The charter boats averaged 39 feet in length, 21 gross tons, 504 horsepower, and were built, on average, in 1979. The party boats had an average length of 102 feet, 85 gross tons, 967 horsepower, and were built on average in 1976. The party boats had an average crew size of three, and averaged 38 anglers per trip. The charter boats had an average crew of two and five passengers. Based on these figures, there are at least 27 party boat crew and 68 charter crew based in Montauk. These figures only include federally permitted vessels and do not include those boats without federal permits and those who do not report VTR data.¹³ According to a representative from the charter boat industry, there are approximately 200 crew employed in party/charter industry alone, not to mention those crew employed by private boat owners, marina personnel, and employees of all the related infrastructure that is based on the sportfishing industry of Montauk.

In the early days of sportfishing in Montauk, many of the commercial fishermen converted their boats in order to take advantage of the growing interest in charters. People hired the inshore scallop boats at first, and then dragger captains began adding tuna towers, fighting chairs, and larger gas tanks for offshore excursions. Some commercial crew would work during the recreational season running charters and switch back to commercial fishing.

Today, most of the charter boats are owner-operated. The number of charters has remained relatively stable over the last decade. A small percentage come and go, but many are long-time participants in the industry. Approximately 75% are full-time, local residents and 25% are seasonal residents who operate their boats during the summer only.

¹³ There are many problems with using VTR data for estimates such as these. According to NMFS representatives who deal with these data, there are great inconsistencies in reporting among party and charter boat operations. The data most certainly underreport both numbers of boats and numbers of trips.

Even among full-time operations, however, supplemental income or pension is needed. Housing and the cost of living is too high for chartering alone to pay the bills. As one charter captain noted, "It is an inside joke that chartering is a job you retire into." Some captains are retired, living on a pension through the winter. Some head south and charter boats in warmer climates like Florida, while others work in construction or some other land job in the off-season. Most of the operations are incorporated for protection from liability and loss. It is notable that many charter boats have commercial landing licenses and permits. Many have striped bass tags, for example, that are used when prices go up at the market, or when no trips have been booked by clients.

Crew are still drawn from the commercial fishing operations in Montauk, and many will jump from the commercial boats to the charter boats during the summer season. Crew are hired by word of mouth for the most part. There are only a few father-son teams among the charters. There is fair turnover among the mates, but captains try to keep them as long as possible and some have remained stable for many years. Charter crew are typically paid by the trip, plus tips. One captain estimated that they receive approximately \$110/day plus 15-20% of the trip total in tips. An estimated 90% of mates and 75% of captains live in Montauk, the remainder living elsewhere in East Hampton Township and Suffolk County, according to an industry representative. Overall, there are no major concerns about crew in Montauk. It is said that there is a drug problem among a small minority of mates, but that this is not a significant issue.

Party boats in Montauk tend to be full-time operations that depend on the industry for a living. Most run half or full day trips, as well as night trips. They fish primarily inshore, but do some tuna and cod fishing. In the past, some converted to commercial fishing gear in the winter and a few do so today - pinhooking or working lobster pots. One captain explained that eight months of the year are devoted to client-based fishing and four months to maintenance and repair. For him, and others, the industry provides 100% of the income. A few of the party boats in Montauk fish every month of the year. Other crew may go to work in Florida during the off season. The eight party boats in Montauk employ roughly four crew each in addition to office personnel. One captain estimates that the industry employs approximately 70 people. Crew are recruited through word of mouth. In recent years, a wave of Irish immigrants to the area have been employed in the party boat industry. Family businesses are common among the party boats in Montauk and turnover among crew is said to be low. One captain asserted that one of his mates has been with him for 17 years. Crew may be paid by the trip, as in the charter boat industry, or as employees of a corporation. Most are said to live in Montauk.

Infrastructure

Montauk features a massive concentration of sportfishing businesses and related infrastructure. Montauk Lake harbors the primary concentration of these businesses. There are approximately 14 major marinas and a number of smaller ones that offer an estimated 1,600 boat slips. The major marinas provide fuel, ice, bait, tackle, storage, and marine supplies. Four large marinas provide haul out service with hydraulic forklifts and travel lifts, and some offer repair services. One marina representative noted that it is

difficult to find and keep good engine mechanics due to the hard work and training that is necessary. There are a number of additional bait and tackle shops in the region that cater to sportfishermen. One major marina rents small boats to fishermen as well. Other businesses that are intimately related to the sportfishing industry include the dozens of hotels, motels, restaurants, bars, and convenience stores that are clustered around Lake Montauk and further south near the center of town and the Atlantic beaches.

Despite the obvious emphasis on recreational fishing in Montauk, access for trailered boats is limited. Unlike other sportfishing destinations, you do not find a heavy flow of trailered boats into and out of Montauk. This is due, in part, to the geographic isolation of the area, at the far Eastern end of Long Island. It is also related to the lack of infrastructure to support trailered boats. One marina in Montauk Harbor charges \$15 to use their launch ramp. East Hampton Township maintains the 'West Lake Launching Ramp' on the western side of Lake Montauk. In order to use it, you must have a launch permit issued by the town. This discourages transient fishermen from using it. However, two sportfishermen from New Jersey who were using the ramp explained that the motel in which they stay provided them with the necessary permit. In addition, there are no lights, no docks or other support structures for the ramp. Some feel that it is in very poor condition.

Shore based fishing is very popular in Montauk and there are miles of beach that allow public access to surf casters. Many shore fishermen obtain four wheel drive beach access permits. State permits cost \$49/year and provide access to state parks including Hither Hills, Napeague, and Montauk Point. Suffolk County permits, which cost \$200/year for nonresidents and \$75/year for residents provide access to Theodore Roosevelt Park, including Shagwong Beach on the Block Island Sound. Finally, East Hampton Town governs vehicular access to town beaches on the Atlantic shore, providing permits to residents free of charge and permits to nonresidents for \$200/year. The town has also recently renovated the fishing pier at Fort Pond Bay.

Sportfishing maintains a massive presence in Montauk but room for growth is limited. Without exception, informants noted that the area has reached saturation. While a number of businesses have expanded in recent years, adding, for example, travel lifts for dry storage, bait freezers, expanded tackle shop, and more slips and dockage, they are now reaching the limit of their potential. One marina owner noted how the expansion that they have experienced ever since the 1960s is now coming to an end. Some explained that there is simply no more room for expansion due to the limited space available for docks, parking, and other structures. Another marina owner estimated that slip space in Montauk is 80-90% occupied. Others, however, see how the potential for growth, reflected in the empty lots and blighted properties near the waterfront, is constrained by the strict permitting process and the town's opposition to growth. The permitting structure, coupled with the cost of expansion, the lack of property and the high capitalization limit the growth of the recreational base. As one marina manager put it: "This is mostly due to the fact that the Town of East Hampton wants to limit growth. You have to get health permits, dock permits, land, building, zoning, and design permits."

Another business owner added, "The recreational [fishing] industry pours money into the town yet the zoning regs make everything a battle."

Economic Networks

Clearly, the sportfishing industry does pour money into the Village of Montauk and East Hampton Township. Informants disagree over which segment of the sportfishing industry is contributing the most to the region's economy. According to a party boat captain, party boat clients spend more time in the village, buying meals, staying at hotels, and buying other merchandise and goods. A representative of the charter boat industry explained that the charter boats not only bring in customers who spend money in the village, but also provide marinas and tackle shops with necessary business - purchasing fuel, bait, ice, and supplies. One marina owner, however, asserted that the private recreational boaters spend much more on bait, fuel, and tackle than the area charters. As a whole, private boaters are said to employ the services of many area providers - summer dockage, winter storage, bait, supplies, restaurants, hotels, fuel, and ice. The charter operators are said to order most tackle from the mail and to repair their own boats: "You see the UPS truck coming in. They only buy something local if they really need it, if something breaks." According to this informant, most charters buy their own bait in bulk and store it. "No money is getting back to local businesses." He did note, however, that the charters become virtually the sole source of income during the spring and fall. Furthermore, this is not the case for other area marinas that have a closer tie to the charter industry. Marinas will generally book trips for the charters that are docked there, and they often expect charters to purchase bait and fuel from them. There are a few independent charter booking services in town.

Marinas do not do business with sportfishermen alone. Some have close economic ties to the commercial fishing industry, providing gear, filters, paint, and parts. Others purchase fresh bait from the fish packing houses or local harvesters who seine for sand eels and shiners. One marina owner estimated that sportfishing accounts for 80% of the business and the other 20% is based on sales and services for the commercial fleet. In interviews with area marina representatives, the percentage of business attributed to sportfishing ranged from 80% to 100%. The sportfishing businesses of the area have ties to other local businesses such as hardware and lumber companies, contractors of all sorts, and repair services. Many have ties to other marinas from which parts and supplies are purchased. The sportfishing marinas also have reciprocal relationships with motels and restaurants that provide mutual recommendations. Beyond the local ties, marinas and other fishing related businesses are engaged in extensive economic networks. One business owner described purchasing bait from L and L Bait in Islip, NY; Regal Bait in Huntington, NY; and Forked River Bait in New Jersey. He also has ties to a marine repair business in Greenport, NY as well as tackle distributors, machine shops, and marine repair businesses in Connecticut.

Representatives from the charter and party boat industry described having close economic ties to local marinas, relying on them for fuel, ice, bait and other services. Regal Bait in Huntington was cited as another important source of bait for party boats.

Seventy five to 80% of charters are said to be hauled out locally and many are said to employ local mechanics. Electronics and navigational equipment is obtained from a variety of businesses on Long Island including Seatronics and Hampton Navigation in Hampton Bays, NY, Marine Electronics in Port Jefferson, NY, and West Marine in Riverhead, NY. Charters and party boats rely on local tackle shops and marinas for fishing gear, as well as national distributors. According to one informant, Bridgehampton National Bank is the best for obtaining boat loans. Boat insurance is obtained from firms such as Maloney and Maloney in Hampton Bays, or Island Wide.

Social Networks and Community Relations

Sportfishing is a vital dimension of the social life of Montauk that is expressed in many ways. Charter captains and recreational fishermen can be found socializing in any one of a number of local establishments, most of which feature photographs and other memorabilia depicting sportfishing in Montauk. The Blessing of the Fleet, which is held every June, attracts many sportfishing charters and private boat owners who participate in the day's festivities.

Montauk is also known for its fishing tournaments. In the mid-1900s, swordfish tournaments sponsored by the prestigious Deep Sea Club, "were considered by many to be the World Series of recreational fishing" (Montauk-online 2000b). Shark fishing tournaments were originally organized by Long Island's 'Fin and Feathers Club.' The Montauk Marine Basin began holding a shark fishing tournament in 1974 and continues to hold them each June. The primary targets are mako, blue shark, and largest overall shark. The local Montauk Boatman's and Captain's Association began sponsoring a shark fishing tournament in 1979 and the Star Island Yacht Club, which inaugurated one in 1986, holds two shark tournaments each year - one in June and a 'Mako Mania' tournament in August. Most sharks caught in these tournaments are released. There is a minimum size that allows for larger fish to be kept. An annual striped bass tournament is sponsored by Freddie's, a local tackle shop, and there are a number of surf fishing tournaments including the Montauk Surf Classic, held in September, and the Montauk Locals Surfcasting Tournament, held during the months of October and November.

Many of these tournaments provide more than an atmosphere of sportfishing in Montauk; they contribute directly to the local community. In recent years, leftover sharks have been donated to food kitchens and shelters on the east end (Tuma 1996). Furthermore, the surplus proceeds of the Montauk Boatman's and Captain's Association shark tournament are contributed to a college scholarship fund for local students. The association also sponsors a Fall Striped Bass Derby during the months of October and November that is open to anyone fishing on one of the participating charter boats, as well as a Fall Striped Bass Tournament held to benefit the Thomas R. Elasser Fund. This is a fund that was created in 1992 to assist the children of New York City firefighters who lost their lives outside of work and hence are not eligible for benefits. As evidence of the importance of fishing tournaments to the town, one informant noted how the town rescheduled a triathlon because it conflicted with the timing of a shark fishing tournament held in June.

The relationship among sportfishermen in Montauk is said to be marked by cooperation. Montauk is home to one of the only organized, politically active charter boat associations in New York. The Montauk Boatman's and Captain's Association website states that it is the "largest group of full time professional charter and party boat captains sailing out of the same port in the entire country"

(<http://www.montauksportfishing.com/mbca.htm#membership>). The membership meets once a month and they hold an annual dinner dance in December. Boaters are said to be generally cooperative with one another, and some communicate with each other and share information on the water via VFH channel 19, although some marinas use their own channels to communicate with the charters that dock with them. It is said that there have been user conflicts through the years between shore fishermen and boat-based anglers, as well as between charter boats, party boats, and private boat fishermen. One sore spot is the creel limit for striped bass. Shore bound and private boat anglers who are allowed one striped bass a day complain that charters are allowed to boat two stripers for each client and make two trips a day.

Conflict among shore-based anglers typically involves turf, and the limited space that is created when anglers shoulder in on each other in an attempt to get a shot at a school of fish passing near the shore. Surf casters and surfers have also been at odds over surf turf. The Montauk Surfcasters Association (MSA), for example, opposes a plan to allow surfers access to Camp Hero, near Montauk Point (see <http://www.surfcasters.org/>). The MSA was founded in 1985 by surf fishermen concerned with maintaining access to area beaches. The nonprofit organization has over nine hundred members, many of whom live further west on Long Island, and in surrounding states including New Jersey, Connecticut, and Pennsylvania. The MSA promotes the interests of surf fishermen at the local and state levels, participates in beach clean-ups, and assists in the maintenance of four wheel drive access roads.

Recreational and commercial fishermen in Montauk are said to coexist, but there are some tensions. One representative from the charter industry explained that while they typically do not bother each other, they definitely differ on many issues related to fisheries management. Interestingly, many commercial fishermen have become captains and crew in the party and charter boat industry. Further, some party and charter boats engage in commercial pinhooking or lobstering in the off-season, a practice that was even more common in the past. The history of sportfishing in Montauk is built on interactions between commercial fishermen and the client-based fishing industry, including the early conversion of commercial craft for charter fishing. In addition, some businesses that cater to sportfishermen are owned and/or operated by people with kinship ties to commercial fishermen. This provides many in Montauk with a view from both sides of an often vitriolic debate between commercial and sportfishing interests. The debate over striped bass has been going on over the past century and continues to fester. Legislation in the 1980s that banned ocean haul seining for striped bass polarized many in the East End communities. According to a local writer, the client-based and commercial industries have since come to realize that they both make a living from the water. The crux of the debate lies between full-time fishermen (commercial and client-based) and the

"part time angler who thinks his fun is being taken away." Among those who live in Montauk, the community takes precedence. The kinship ties between commercial and charter fishermen are complex and interwoven. "Everyone knows each other and everyone here has some connection to fishing." Even so, the old families of baymen do tend to scoff at those who "play with their food." According to one informant, the real problem lies with recreational anglers further up island who do not have any knowledge of commercial fishing or connection to those who do.

Participants in Montauk's sportfishing industry are keenly aware of the maritime history of the area and many expressed the belief that Montauk truly is a fishing community. Some feel that area businesses and residents take the importance of recreational fishing for granted and fail to promote it as actively as it should be. It should be noted that the center of boating activity is several miles away from the town center, and the Point, considered to be the Mecca of surf fishing, is even further down the road. It is said that some residents and visitors never even come to the dock area. So, despite the rich history and present socioeconomic importance of sportfishing in Montauk, there is the sense that not enough is being done to sustain it by the Town of East Hampton.

Discussion: Community/fisheries dependency and engagement

Montauk's identity is built, in part, on its historical connection to sportfishing. Once the fishing grounds of literary and sportfishing legends like Hemingway and Zane Grey, Montauk has since become the Mecca of surf casters, and the destination of thousands of charter and party boat clients. Its popularity as a sportfishing port has grown steadily since the late 19th century, attracting a wide diversity of anglers who come to take advantage of its unique position at the End, where inshore and offshore waters teem with a variety of game species. Socially and culturally, Montauk expresses its connection to sportfishing through community events, fishing tournaments, iconography, and the general discourse among residents and visitors.

The value of the sportfishing industry to Montauk's economy is indispensable, especially during the 'shoulders' of the tourist season in the spring and fall when fishing is at its best and summer vacationers have gone home. As mentioned in the discussion section of the commercial fishing segment of this report, Montauk experiences a large influx of seasonal visitors. Employment data reveal the importance of seasonal tourism to the community. The top three industry employment categories in 2000 include arts/entertainment/recreation/accommodation/food services at 20%; construction at 19%; and retail trade at 10%. The sportfishing industry is an integral component of Montauk's seasonal tourism. According to one charter captain, the striped bass fishery has played a major role in maintaining businesses through the fall. "The hotels stay open in the fall and spring for the fishermen. Between April and June and September to November, the area is devoid of tourists - people are here to fish." Area businesses demonstrate an awareness of the importance of sportfishing by referring customers to charter and party boats, marinas, and other fishing businesses.

Many business owners and participants in the recreational fishing industry feel that the town does not demonstrate an awareness of the industry's value and importance. "They talk about revitalization but they haven't made a difference." Another business complained that the town has so many environmental concerns that expansion is difficult. A representative from the charter industry cited the town's commitment to commercial fishing and the improvements made to the town's commercial docks. "The town does absolutely nothing to promote the charter industry."

The Town of East Hampton does recognize the importance of recreational fishing in the 2003 Comprehensive Plan and has initiated measures to protect, maintain, and revitalize the waterfront for recreational uses. The plan states that recreational fishing has "a vital impact on the economic stability of East Hampton," noting that "over 100,000 anglers come to the East End annually and over 100 charter, party, and guided boats operate out of East Hampton's ports contributing, by Committee estimate, in excess of \$350 million to the local economy" (Horne Rose LLC et al. 2003:25). The town has a Local Waterfront Revitalization Plan and has commissioned a study of the waterfront area around Lake Montauk. According to a representative of the town, the waterfront study has been focusing on ways to improve infrastructure and find solutions to the housing crisis in the area while maintaining the fishing character of the waterfront. The area around Lake Montauk was designated a "waterfront zone" by the town in 1984 with the intent of favoring waterfront uses related to recreational and commercial fishing. The town has also demonstrated a commitment to recreational fishing by acquiring and improving land, such as the pier at Fort Pond Bay.

Some consider Montauk to be a fishing community based on the presence of the sportfishing industry, its economic contribution, and the sociocultural and historical connection to fishing. Others feel that Montauk is a tourist community with a lot of fishermen, due to the increasing number of second home owners and tourists who come to the area for the beaches and relaxation, not fishing. Most agree, however, that the village would be economically devastated and socially diminished without the recreational fishing industry.

III. Vulnerability and Cumulative Impacts

A. Commercial Fishing

Gentrification and Economic Development

Commercial fishermen and industry representatives expressed concern over the rising cost of living in Montauk, the difficulty finding affordable housing due to the real estate boom, and the high cost of rent that prevents some crew and industry personnel from living in the village. One fisherman described how he and his son, who is also a commercial fisherman, are only able to stay in Montauk because they live on property that was purchased many years ago. The median house value of specified owner-occupied homes in 2000 was \$290,400 (U.S Census 2000). According to East Hampton

Comprehensive Plan, there were 148 housing units sold in 2001 with an average selling price tag of \$535,000 (Horne Rose LLC et al. 2003). The number of these homes that could be afforded by those with the median Montauk household income of \$42,329 is zero. "This means that teachers, Town workers, many seniors and other people who make up the fabric of the community can no longer afford to buy a home in East Hampton. Over time, homes of workers who currently live in the Town will change hands and become the next round of million dollar housing" (ibid: 23). Median monthly rent for renter-occupied units was \$863. Sixty five percent of renters pay \$750/month and above for rental units in Montauk according to the 2000 US Census. For nearly 40% of renters the gross rent was 35% or more of the total household income in 1999. In the Town of East Hampton, in general, 25% of renters put more than 50% of their income towards rent. A town representative remarked that the town is at a turning point, "we are at risk of losing our middle-class."

The housing problem is especially acute among the growing population of Hispanic immigrants. Since 1990, the Hispanic population of Montauk grew by an addition 624 individuals and now represents 24% of the village's population. The lack of affordable housing for workers is compelling overcrowding and/or illegal living arrangements. According to a town representative, the town has been made aware of how the housing crisis translates into the challenge for the commercial industry to recruit and house crew members. The town has funded a study to explore opportunities for affordable housing along the waterfront of Lake Montauk.

The housing crisis, in which the construction of million dollar mansions plays a significant role, has not translated into any major waterfront access issues for the commercial fishing industry. People are concerned, however, that one of the long standing fish packing houses could be threatened by development. The owner, who has kept the dock in operation for over forty years, could potentially sell the property or lease it to other interests for a greater profit. In addition, much of the development in the area is viewed as catering to temporary visitors who make their money elsewhere, and do little to contribute to the year-round local economy and society.

The development of the area is actually encouraging one fish packing business to expand. These expansions are being designed to take advantage of the growing tourist trade. The dock owns seven acres of land that were purchased in 1999 to go with the floating dock. The owners plan to establish a retail dry goods market, restaurant, and tourist-related shops. It is hoped that the new businesses will compensate for any shortfalls in landings that result from tighter regulations or fluctuations in availability of product. They did plan to expand the dock, obtain another ice machine, and purchase another fuel tank, but these plans are being delayed as a result of the uncertainty associated with the court rulings over Amendment 13 of the multispecies groundfish FMP. Another operation would like to expand, but has run into permitting difficulties. The business owner spoke of, "the terror, the terror" of the permitting process, and the uncertain outcomes.

Environment

Participants in the commercial fishing industry did not voice any major environmental concerns aside from the necessity of keeping the Montauk Inlet dredged. The Comprehensive Plan for the Town of East Hampton does, however, enumerate additional environmental concerns of the Fishing Committee including storm water abatement and road runoff. Lobstermen of Montauk, as well as other baymen, have also had to deal with a host of environmental problems associated with the Long Island Sound including brown tides, the lobster die-off, and the spread of shell-rot in lobster populations. Finally, commercial fishermen in Montauk often find themselves at odds with environmental lobbies that push for greater regulatory control over fishing practice. The suit brought by the Conservation Law Foundation and other environmental groups against NMFS concerning groundfish conservation was one of more visible clashes between fishermen and environmentalists.

Fisheries Management

Many Montauk commercial fishermen are "fed up" with fisheries management and regulation. The issues of concern vary by gear group, fishery, and a host of factors. Overall, fishermen note that the cumulative effect of the various state and federal regulations is creating distrust of government among fishermen who are otherwise very patriotic citizens. The cumulative effect of regulations is said to be forcing people out of business, and forestalling the transmission of fishing knowledge between generations as recruitment to the industry declines.

The degree of dissatisfaction with the fisheries management process depends, in part, on gear type, fishery, and the regulatory history of each. The tilefish longliners in Montauk have only recently been placed under a fishery management plan. This FMP, which went into effect in November, 2001, cut the 4 million pound quota in half, and then distributed this quota among four tiers of boats. The first tier receives 66% of the quota, the second receives 15%, the third receives 19% and the fourth receives incidental landings. Each of the Montauk boats is in the first tier and, as a group, they are the only boats in the first tier. The owners have developed a system to share the quota, in order to allow each boat to fish all year and to keep the market stable. The fleet has adapted well to the FMP, avoiding the derby-style fishing that often accompanies quarterly quota management regimes. Others note that this may be due to the small number of boats involved in the fishery. One effect of the FMP has been to shorten the length of most voyages from ten days to seven or eight days. This was one of the means by which the fleet was able to spread the quota out over the year. Another effect was the loss of crew. In the past, boats would employ two crews which would work alternate trips. The dock that packs the tilefish in Montauk lost income as a result of the FMP, but on the positive side, the regulations in concert with the arrangement among the boats allows the dock to predict landings with some degree of accuracy. However, the other management issues are considered to be a threat to stability of the business:

"You never know what will come up next - birds, marine mammals; there is always fear and uncertainty in the business. Stocks have recovered for

many species like fluke, scup, and striped bass, and fishermen have helped the recovery but they are never given anything back."

Among the pinhookers, quota closures are said to be particularly problematic. One pinhooker explained that scup closures have hurt him in the summer, which is vexing in light of the fact that party boats can still land 50 fish/person after the quota is caught. The quota system is said to have ruined the scup market by making the availability of scup unpredictable and inconsistent. On the positive side, the separate fluke quota for hook and line fishermen is saving some pinhookers. There is also concern over the few tags allocated to pinhookers for the capture of striped bass, a fish that has rebounded dramatically. A pinhooker, who may use up to one hundred tags between July 1 and December 16, unhappily pointed out that charter boats (which carry six passengers) can take two fish/angler, and make two trips a day - or 24 fish in one day alone.

Trawlers appear to be one of the most disaffected gear groups in Montauk, expressing a high degree of dissatisfaction with fisheries management measures and the science on which they are based. Montauk trawlers were intimately involved in side-by-side trawls conducted by the Northeast Fisheries Science Center. The discontinuation of funding for these trawls, along with the debacle known as "Trawl Gate" in which a federal survey vessel was found to have uneven trawl warps, heightened discontent among Montauk trawlers. These problems were compounded by US District Judge Kessler's ruling on the lawsuit brought against the NMFS concerning the conservation of groundfish. Groundfish were once very important to the Montauk fleet. As aforementioned, Montauk draggers with a history of groundfish landings were provided incentives by the federal government to shift effort to underutilized species like squid and whiting. As a result, fishermen who invested in underutilized species became vulnerable to "use it or lose it" regulatory policies that limit the days at sea among those who have spent less time fishing for groundfish in subsequent years. At the time of this research, fishermen expressed the concern that displaced New England groundfishermen may be compelled to move into their fisheries in response to more stringent groundfish regulation. One fishermen described the stress that he, his wife, and other community members were feeling, due to worries that groundfishermen from New England might descend on the squid and whiting fisheries.

The dependence of the Montauk dragger fleet on squid, whiting, and a "mixed-trawl" of other species results in great anxiety over the imposition of a trip limits. The 2,500 pound trip limit on loligo squid, which is imposed when a certain percentage of the quarterly quota is landed, is said to have incurred a loss of over a quarter of a million dollars to one operation alone in 2002. Trip limits on fluke are also problematic because vessels from New Jersey and Rhode Island can fish in the same waters, catch much greater numbers, and land them in their home states.

The quota system encourages boats to work quickly to capture the available fish. When fish are plentiful, they are caught quickly, trip limits are triggered, and the larger boats must sit idle due to the small limits allowed. This system encourages fishermen to work in bad weather and to keep fishing longer in order to get their share of the quota before it

is filled. The safety issues are obvious in light of the crew's constant work and little sleep during these trips. One fisherman described these dangers, noting that his boat is going back out one day after returning from a ten day trip. The quota system is also held responsible for problems associated with the sale of product. The derby-fishing that accompanies quota management leads to gluts in the market and cheap returns for the fishermen. According to the manager of a fish packing operation, this is what happened in the whiting fishery in 2002. After the trip limits were triggered, the dock was shipping roughly one load a week (550 cartons) rather than the dozen or so loads that are possible. Dock workers were not working forty hours per week and the trucking company was traveling to three docks in order to fill a trailer. The owner of another Montauk dock explained that the quota system creates instability in the market which compels buyers to rely on imports for a consistent supply.¹⁴

Trip limits are also considered to be the source of the regulatory discard problem for the fleet. The fishermen expressed great dismay over discard, calling it a "crime against nature," and a "crime against humanity." One captain expressed disgust at having to throw away perfectly marketable fish due to trip limits. He said that fishermen are getting very callous towards management because of the discard and waste that they are forced to engage in. "Throwing fish over the side is barbaric." He explained that management has brainwashed fishermen into thinking that it is alright to throw fish away which is making the fishermen look bad. "Fishing is my religion. It [discard] is like asking me to be unfaithful to my religion." Many of the draggers favor cumulative trip limits that would allow fishermen to keep more of what they catch in one trip while limiting the overall number of trips they take. This will reduce discard and allow boats to plan for the year's activities.

Quotas, alone, are not the only problem. It is the fact that many quotas are determined on a state-by-state basis that raises the ire of many Montauk fishermen. State-by-state quotas are considered to be a bane of commercial draggers and commercial fishermen in New York more broadly. Historically, New York's landings data have been dreadfully inaccurate as a result of the state's poor record keeping. This has resulted in New York receiving small shares of species allocations such as black sea bass and summer flounder. The state simply could not demonstrate the historical importance of these and other species due to a lack of data and undercounting.

Area closures are also criticized for their negative impact on the dragger fleet. In 2000, the 6A scup Gear Restricted Area (GRA) is said to have resulted in a 66% decline in income, and the loss of two employees for one of the docks between November and December.

Resilience and Representation

¹⁴ According to one informant, this scenario is often repeated because the whiting market is volume sensitive. The prices drop markedly whenever boats focus on whiting as a result of restrictions in other fisheries.

The ability of commercial fishermen in Montauk to weather the cumulative effects of regulations in concert with the rising cost of living and other forces of change has been tested. There are said to be approximately 300 area families that are involved in the commercial fishing industry. Some fishermen have left the industry, while others are doing well. The number of Montauk residents employed in agriculture, forestry, and fisheries dropped from 139 in 1990 to 103 in the 2000 US Census.¹⁵ This decline likely involves the loss of certain jobs in commercial fisheries. According to one informant, the fishermen in the area are making less overall, but many still manage to live comfortably. They pointed out that certain fishermen cling to a "highliner" mentality, making certain shortfalls sound disastrous, when in reality they are well-off. This informant pointed out the inconsistency of fishermen driving to fisheries meetings in brand new trucks and stating that regulations are "killing" them. In reality, some commercial fishermen in Montauk are "hurting" while others are making a good living. Few would disagree that presently it takes much more work and effort to maintain the same level of living in the fishing industry that people experienced in the past.

The commercial fishermen of Montauk are involved in a number of organizations that lobby for the industry and represent commercial fishermen at the state and federal level. The Long Island Commercial Fishing Association, which represents a diversity of gear types, is very active in promoting commercial fishing in Montauk and across Long Island. The President is a longliner and dragger captain, and the Executive Director is married to a commercial fisherman who operates out of Montauk. The Executive Board is composed of members from all fishing gear types across Long Island. The pinhookers of Montauk are represented by the New York Commercial Hook and Line Association, which is very much concerned with fluke, scup, and sea bass regulations. The manager of one of the local docks is extremely involved in fisheries management, spending an estimated 40% of her time on management issues. She attends meetings on behalf of the Montauk draggers and represents the interests of the dock owners. They are very active in promoting commercial fishing and local seafood, and participate in the "Pride of New York" campaign to raise consumer awareness of local fishing practice and products. Education is considered essential in building a better image of commercial fishing and combating the negative stereotypes generated by environmental lobbies. Fishermen are also involved in the Scientific Monitoring Committee of the National Fisheries Institute, one of the leading trade associations for the fish and seafood industry. Other industry members are involved in the Northeast Seafood Coalition, which was formed in January 2002 in response to the lawsuit brought by the Conservation Law Foundation against the NMFS (CLF, et al. v. Evans, Civil. No. 00-1134 GK (D.D.C.)).

The degree of participation in fisheries management varies among the fishermen. One informant noted that fishermen will get involved when they have to. Many are "fed up" and frustrated over a bureaucracy that is considered to have a life of its own, and a decision-making process that systematically excludes the views of fishermen. Many feel that they cannot afford to attend meetings, and that presenting their opinion to managers who have already decided outcomes is not worth losing a day of fishing. One captain

¹⁵ The accuracy of these census employment data is questionable. There are likely more than one hundred people employed in fisheries in Montauk.

explained why the process is burning him out: "Management is paying lip service to fishermen but are not really providing them with a voice. Other fishermen won't get involved because it demands too much of their time and the management does not respect the knowledge of fishermen." In addition, many expressed the opinion that the government of New York cares little for commercial fishing. They also feel alienated from the federal process because they have no seat on the New England Fisheries Management Council, which controls whiting and groundfish, which are key species for Montauk trawlers.¹⁶ In 2003, a bill was introduced to the US Congress that would give New York a seat on the New England Fisheries Management Council. The legislation, known as the New York Fair Fishing Act, is intended to address the lack of representation that New York commercial fishermen have on the council that makes decisions on species that are critical to New York.

Commercial fishermen in Montauk are also concerned about the lack of recruitment to the industry and what this might mean for the future of their community and way of life. Recruitment into commercial fishing has slowed as a result of the cumulative effects of fisheries regulations and the permitting structure. The limited entry into certain fisheries prevents fishermen from adapting to changes in the natural and regulatory environments by shifting to other fisheries. Some fisheries, like fluke, scup, and sea bass are closed to new entries while others like scalloping are "bloody expensive" to get into. Many Montauk fishermen have a diversity of permits which allows them to make ends meet by participating in a number of fisheries. Some would like the option of consolidating catch quota, which would allow more than one permitted captain to work on the same vessel and catch more than the trip limit for a single boat. The difficulty of transferring state permits further limits recruitment to the industry and creates an impediment to following a career path towards boat ownership.

One captain described his own career path. He started fishing at the age of twelve, and then worked his way from deckhand to pilot to boat owner. He explained that it would be next to impossible for someone to follow a similar path today because they would not be able to get the permits that are necessary. "They would have to buy the history," including the boat and its permits (which have become more valuable than the boats themselves). He is not hopeful that his son will be able to continue the trade, even though he could inherit his permits. Others noted that no one is crazy enough to invest in fishing because it is too costly and unpredictable, not to mention that the banks are not willing to lend money. The problem with recruitment has a direct impact on commercial operations due to the difficulty of finding reliable crew. The "doom and gloom" that surrounds the industry, coupled with smaller landings and an unpredictable future is said to drive away many of the most competent personnel. Poor recruitment, the lower quality of crew, and diminished income work in a negative feedback cycle - boats may have to operate "bare bones" because they don't make enough to be properly equipped. This, in turn, increases risks at sea, decreases efficiency and profits, and leads once again to a lack of recruitment.

¹⁶ According to a document distributed for the groundfish FMP Amendment 13 public hearings, Montauk is ranked seventh among all ports for total groundfish landings.

B. Recreational Fishing

Gentrification and Economic Development

The housing crisis described above has also created problems for the recreational fishing industry. The local residents can not afford to buy or rent the property, and local high school and college graduates are unable to find a job in the area that will pay the bills. Businesses, including many associated with the recreational industry are forced to employ transient labor because no one can afford to live locally. The "trade parade" of trucks and vans carrying a motley assortment of contractors into and out of Montauk each day and tying up traffic for miles along Route 27 is indicative of the explosion in home building and the inability of the area to maintain its own labor pool. The area is just about "built out" according to an East Hampton Town representative.

The increasing cost of living associated with the second home and tourist industry has translated into declining standard of living for many locals involved in providing the services and goods in that economy. One resident business owner remarked, "Go and look at the prices in the deli and at the markets. People have to go west to do shopping - 45 minutes to Bridgehampton." While the second homes industry is growing, the local businesses are less capable of expansion for a variety of reasons. According to a number of waterfront business owners, the town, under the influence of the second home owners who now have "their own," wants to limit growth and keep more people from coming to the area. This, according to accounts, is reflected in the costly and unpredictable permitting process for waterfront businesses. According to one recreational fishing-related business owner, the town's zoning laws and restrictions make it difficult to make improvements. The costs for architects, attorneys, and impact studies must be met without any guarantee that the plans will pass "The town's normal response is 'no' to anyone who wants to bang a nail."

The town, however, points out that there are numerous reasons why expansion of businesses in the recreational fishing industry is not feasible. Some businesses are limited by the fact that Lake Montauk bottom land is owned by individual property owners. Other expansion plans have been rejected because the improvements would conflict with boat traffic patterns, or create the need for more parking that is currently unavailable. In addition there are many environmental demands that must be met. A representative from the town explained that Montauk was "site planned" much later than the rest of East Hampton, and so many residents who were not familiar with the permitting process felt that they could do whatever they wanted. "We are tough, and don't rubberstamp everything that comes along but we try to make decisions quickly and the process is not so bad." The town protected many recreational fishing businesses on Lake Montauk by creating a waterfront zone in 1984 that favors recreational and commercial fishing uses over other businesses.¹⁷

¹⁷ One waterfront business owner indicated that his property is now zoned "resort" which does not allow any further expansion of marinas.

Development has not been entirely negative for the recreational fishing industry because it has obviously brought quite a few boat owners and wealthy sportfishermen into the area. As one marina manager put it, "Montauk's residential growth brings in boat owners and buyers. We get many entry level boaters coming in." A number of others voiced a similar ambivalence about development - citing the lack of affordable housing, increasing cost of living, and the concomitant second home boom that brings more recreational fishermen.

While gentrification and development has had both positive and negative impacts on the recreational fishing industry of Montauk, the success of the industry is said to depend ultimately on the overall economic climate. "Post 9-11 business dropped like a stone because many of our customers are firemen and business people in New York." Others note that pleasure pursuits, such as fishing, are the first victims of a sour economy.

Environment

Like commercial fishermen in Montauk, representatives of the sportfishing industry did not raise any serious concerns about the environment. A few did express their belief that commercial fishermen are responsible for declines in fish stocks. Most, however, highlighted the role of the weather in the success and failure of the recreational fishing industry. "When the weather is bad, people don't fish." Many commented on how the high winds, rough seas, and rain destroyed the profitability of the 2002 fall fishing season. Wind from the East, Northeast, and Southeast hurt many of the area charters and marine businesses.

The Comprehensive Plan for the Town of East Hampton enumerates environmental concerns of the Fishing Committee including storm water abatement and road runoff. In addition, certain environmental regulations, such as those governing the painting of boat hulls, have created more costs and paperwork for some Montauk businesses. The new laws require boats to be painted at licensed marinas/boat yards by licensed painters. One marina owner explained that customers, including the charter boat owners, thought the marina was scamming them at first. This new law is problematic due to the small, transient pool of labor available to these businesses and the need to train and license them. "Workers come and go and you can't invest in training if they are going to leave in a season. Each person who paints must have an applicator's license and they need to take a course in Nassau County to get it - it is all a burden on the business owner." While the law does provide more income to the marinas some consider it too burdensome in light of these considerations.

Fisheries Management

Each of the many different gear and interest groups in the recreational fishing industry of Montauk has its own particular view of fisheries management. Striped bass regulations have always been a cause of contention among area anglers. The concerns over commercial harvest continue today, despite the fact that recreational fishing accounts for a much greater proportion of the striped bass harvest in New York. Even within the

recreational industry there is disagreement over allocation of striped bass. Private boat and shore based anglers may keep one striped bass while charter clients are allowed to harvest two. Some feel that these bag limits, which allow six-pack charter boats to harvest up to 24 fish/day when running two trips each day is unfair. One business owner who deals with recreational fishermen asserted that it is unfair that fishermen who put so much into the local economy get so little in return compared to what a charter customer puts in and takes out. This is also said to have a negative effect on businesses that rely on the activity of private boat owners who are unlikely to stay in if they can only bring home one fish.

While area fishermen tend to support conservation measures, and believe that they have resulted in increasing populations of species like sea bass, fluke, scup and striped bass, some feel that they remain too restrictive. The ten fish bag limit on bluefish, for example, is held responsible for the driving down the demand for night bluefishing among party and charter boat clients in the 1990s. The closure of the harbor of Block Island to flounder fishing is also said to have had a negative impact on the client-based fishing businesses.

Many fishermen feel that better education and outreach must accompany regulatory actions. Some stated that there is too much confusion over the complex mixture of state and federal regulations. The public and recreational fishing businesses are not always aware of changes in the regulations and the government should make a better effort to provide relevant information. Part of the problem with making information accessible is the inability of recreational industry participants and anglers to attend meetings and hearings that are held during the busy seasons when people have to be working. The negative feelings over the complexity of regulations are exacerbated by the strict enforcement behavior of the local officer. The local enforcement officer is said to be extremely strict, administering fines for the slightest infractions. "The regulations make criminals out of fishermen."

Charter operators are opposed to their categorization as recreational fishermen. Many feel that they should be given a special status as client-based businesses that make a living from the resources. As one captain put it, "There should be three categories: commercial harvesters, recreational fishermen, and sportfishing industry participants." For charters, the bluefin tuna limit was once very difficult, driving offshore boats to inshore fisheries during the fall. The limit has since been raised which has been a welcomed relief to offshore charters. One representative of the charter industry voiced opposition to Marine Protected Areas (MPAs), asserting that they are politically motivated and unjustified, especially in light of the small role that he attributes to recreational fishing in the harvest of resources. "We have accepted the bag limits and restrictions due to the success of the striped bass regulations, but we can not tolerate political moratoria."

Among party boat operations, bag limits have been less problematic than closed seasons on species like porgy, fluke, and striped bass. Were it not for these closures, some boats could fish an additional month on each side of the current season. According to one

captain, party boat clientele care less than charter clients about how many fish they can bring home and the minimum sizes. The bag limits are actually credited with eliminating some of the "meat" fishermen and helping to refine the clientele by encouraging a conservation ethic. The regulations on striped bass and sea bass are held responsible for actually bringing out more clientele since the rebound of these populations. Of greater concern to some are the increasingly burdensome Coast Guard regulations and new safety codes that require watertight bulkheads, expensive life rafts, and new halogen automatic fire extinguishers - improvements that cost tens of thousands of dollars.

Resilience and Representation

The recreational fishing industry of Montauk has adapted remarkably to the economic, social, environmental, and regulatory changes that have occurred over the many years of its existence. The adaptability is based, in part, on diversification. From the earliest days that brought blue collar fishermen on the train to fish out of Fort Pond Bay on party boats for scup, and elites who went offshore in search of swordfish, Montauk has attracted anglers from across the spectrum. The diversity of businesses cater to a wide variety of fishing interests, the pursuit of which is made possible by the myriad inshore and offshore angling opportunities associated with Montauk. The industry supports a large party boat and charter boat clientele, private boat owners, surf casters, and many categories of anglers within each pursuit - from middle class meat hunters to well-heeled fly fishing aficionados. The ability of the area to sustain this diversity is a testament to Montauk's location amidst rich fishing grounds and the acumen of those who participate in the community's economic and social life.

Diversity is important due to the booms and busts in the recreational fishing industry created by the overall state of the economy in combination with the weather. Many marine businesses have purposely diversified in order to take advantage of the high volume of angler and tourist traffic by adding bars and restaurants. A number of representatives from the recreational fishing industry in Montauk explained that their businesses depend on good weather and a good US economy. One marina operator pointed out that, "Post 9-11 business dropped like a stone because many of our customers are firemen and business people in New York. When the economy is down, pleasure is the first to go."

The political activity of Montauk anglers is another reason why the recreational industry is so visible and viable. Over one hundred licensed captains participate in the Montauk Boatmen's and Captain's Association (MBCA), which is said to be the largest association of its kind on the East Coast under the umbrella of the Recreational Fishing Alliance. The charter boat captains in Montauk are said to be more organized and involved in the MBCA than party boat operators. According to a party boat captain, while only a handful are members of the MBCA, all of the captains are members of the National Party Boat Association. Members of the MBCA contribute \$50 each year to a political action fund that is used to represent their interests at that local, state and federal level. A representative of the association explained that it is the most active organization to which he belongs. It is difficult, however, for many to participate in the fisheries management

process due to the time away from business that it requires. And those who are less active "tend to complain after the barn door is open." Montauk anglers participate in a variety of other local, regional, and national fishing organizations such as the Montauk Surfcasters Association, New York Sportfishing Federation, American Sportfishing Association, Recreational Fishing Alliance, and the International Game Fish Association.

According to a charter captain, the need to organize has grown in importance over the past ten to fifteen years as a result of commercial over-fishing and regulations that have become increasingly burdensome for recreational fishermen. He feels that the commercial fishermen have a much stronger lobby and that recreational fishing lags behind, especially in fisheries science. He pointed out the problems with the Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistics Survey (MRFSS) data, which is used to determine allocations based on estimates of catch and effort among recreational fishermen. Many recreational fishermen denounce the data from MRFSS, which they consider to be generated with shoddy, unreliable methods. Informants characterized the recreational industry as a sleeping giant that generates massive amounts of capital, and say it is only a matter of time before their voice is heard.

Overall, there is optimism about the future of recreational fishing in Montauk and a sense that business will continue as usual. Recreational fishing is a deeply embedded aspect of the local identity, and an inextricable component of the village's social and economic life. Even so, there are many lingering doubts about the future. Some expressed concerns over the state of fish stocks, and a fisheries management process that is run amok. Others highlight the local challenges such as waterfront revitalization, the difficulties of businesses to grow under draconian permitting processes and the town's aversion to development, the rising cost of living, and the lack of affordable housing. While all of these issues will have an impact on the sportfishing industry, there is little doubt that Montauk will remain a Mecca among recreational fishermen.

Appendix 1: Port Activity by Gear Type and Landings, % Pounds and % Value, Montauk NY 1994-2001; Source: NMFS Weighout Data

Ne gear	Gearcode	1994		1995		1996		1997		1998		1999		2000		2001	
		% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value
010	LLB	11	17	11	17	21	34	21	27	11	21	5	12	6	13	10	21
020	HND	3	4	2	1	3	5	3	5	3	7	3	6	3	6	3	7
034		0.03	0.04	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.01	0.002	0.004	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.01	0.002	0.003
040	LLP	8	23	10	25	4	11	5	13	3	9	3	9	2	5	1	4
050	OTF	69	39	68	42	70	47	70	52	80	60	87	69	82	55	82	61
052	OTC	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.002	0.01	0	0
070		0.3	0.1	0.2	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.04	0.01	0.01	0.1	0.1	0.05	0.04	0.0002	0.0003
090		0	0	0.001	0.001	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
100	GNS	1	1	0.3	0.1	1	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
103		0	0	0.2	0.04	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
110	GNT	0.1	0.3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
132	DRS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0003	0.0003	0	0	0	0	0.002	0.001	0	0
140		0	0	0.02	0.02	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
142		0.2	0.2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	0.3	0.4
143		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0003	0.001	0	0
170	PTM	2	5	3	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
180	PTO, PTX	0	0	0.01	0.01	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.003	0	0
181	PTF	0.4	1	0.1	0.1	0.05	0.05	0.1	0.2	0.1	0.3	0.3	1	0.1	0.2	0.2	0.3
182		0	0	0.003	0.003	0.002	0.003	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.02	0	0
183	PTW	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.04	0.02	0.002	0.004	0.04	0.03	0.1	0.1
200	PTL	2	5	1	2	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.1	0.4	0.02	0.1	0.05	0.03	0.3	0.4
210		1	2	3	6	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.3	0.4	1	1	2	5	18	1	4
231		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0002	0.001
250	RAK	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0001	0.0003	0	0	0.002	0.001	0.01	0.003	0	0
251		0	0	0	0	0	0	0.02	0.03	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
270		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0001	0.00003	0	0	0	0	0	0
281		0	0	0	0	0	0	0.004	0.004	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
300	PTC	0	0	0	0	0.001	0.0003	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.1	0.04	0.3	0.2
301		1	0.3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.02	0.01	0.02	0.01
310		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0004	0.002
322		0	0	0.0004	0.0004	0.001	0.001	0	0	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.003	0.004	0.01	0.01	0.01
330	DIV	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.03	0.002	0.004
350	OTB	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.03	0	0	0	0
410		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.02	0.005
411		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.01	0.001	0	0
999	OTH, MIX	2	3	0.01	0.01	0	0	0.0002	0.001	0	0	0	0	0.003	0.01	0	0

Appendix 1 Gear Codes:

Ne gear	Gear Name
10	LONGLINE, BOTTOM
20	HANDLINE
34	SPEARS
40	LONGLINE, PELAGIC
50	TRAWL, OTTER, BOTTOM, FISH
52	TRAWL, OTTER, BOTTOM, SCALLOP
70	HAUL SEINE, BEACH, COMMON
90	DIP NET, COMMON
100	GILL NET, FIXED OR ANCHORED, SINK, OTHER/NK SPECIES
103	GILL NET, SET, SALMON
110	GILL NET, DRIFT, OTHER/NK SPECIES
132	DREDGE, SCALLOP, SEA
140	POUND NET, OTHER/NK SPECIES
142	POUND NET, FISH
143	POUND NET, HORSESHOE CRAB
170	TRAWL, OTTER, MIDWATER PAIRED
180	POTS + TRAPS, OTHER/NK SPECIES
181	POTS + TRAPS, FISH
182	POTS + TRAPS, EEL
183	POTS + TRAPS, CONCH
200	POT/TRAP, LOBSTER OFFSH NK
210	POT/TRAP, LOBSTER INSH NK
231	BY HAND, OYSTERS
250	RAKES, OTHER/NK SPECIES
251	RAKES, OYSTER
270	BOX TRAP
281	DREDGE, OYSTER COMMON
300	POTS + TRAPS, CRAB OTHER
301	POTS + TRAPS, BLUE CRAB
310	LIFT NET
322	FYKE NET, FISH
330	DIVING GEAR
350	BEAM TRAWL, OTHER/NK SPECIES
410	TONGS AND GRABS, OTHER/NK SPECIES
411	TONGS AND GRABS, CLAM
999	UNKNOWN

Appendix 2: Port Activity by Species Landed, % Pounds and % Value, Montauk, NY, 1994-2001; Source: NMFS Weighout Data

Species	1994		1995		1996		1997		1998		1999		2000		2001	
	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value	% pound	% value
OTH	8	5	10	5	14	5	8	3	10	5	9	5	8	4	9	5
WHT	28	12	29	12	23	10	28	16	31	16	23	13	19	10	37	23
MNK	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	2	0.5	1	1	1
FLN	2	2	4	4	4	5	4	5	5	7	6	7	7	6	5	5
PEL	5	2	7	3	8	3	5	3	5	3	4	3	4	2	5	2
FF	6	7	4	5	8	11	6	10	5	10	4	8	4	8	4	9
TUN	9	25	11	24	3	8	3	9	2	5	2	7	1	3	1	3
FLK	5	9	5	10	5	9	3	6	3	7	3	6	3	6	2	5
DOG	0	0	0	0	0.001	0.0001	0.005	0.001	0.01	0.005	2	0.4	1	0.2	0.1	0.03
LOB	3	6	3	7	0.1	0.2	0.1	0.4	0.5	2	1	2	5	19	1	5
SCL	0.003	0.01	0.05	0.2	0.01	0.1	0.02	0.1	0.002	0.002	0.01	0.1	0.01	0.05	0.02	0.1
SQL	21	12	14	8	14	10	21	15	24	20	41	33	40	23	25	20
SHF	1	0.3	0.1	0.02	0.1	0.04	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.04	0.005	0.004	0.1	0.04	0.1	0.1
OQ	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.0004	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
SWD	1	4	2	6	1	3	1	4	1	3	1	2	1	2	0.5	2
EEL	0.001	0	0.001	0.001	0.003	0.002	0.0001	0	0.002	0.01	0.0002	0	0.01	0.02	0.0001	0
TIL	10	16	11	16	20	33	21	27	12	21	5	12	6	13	10	20

Species Codes:

- OTH Species other than those listed below
- WHT whiting (silver hake)
- MNK monkfish
- FLN flounders: winter flounder, witch flounder, yellowtail, american plaice, sand-dab, flounders, southern flounder
- PEL pelagics: bluefish, butterfish, king mackerel, menhaden
- FF finfish: atlantic croaker, scup, black sea bass, weakfish, striped bass, spot
- TUN tuna: bluefin tuna, big eye tuna, albacore tuna, yellowfin tuna
- FLK summer flounder
- DOG dogfish
- LOB lobster
- SCL scallop
- SQL squid: loligo and illex
- SHF shellfish: blue crab, horseshoe crab, panaeid shrimp, quahogs, conches, channeled whelk, oysters
- OQ ocean quahog and surf clam
- SWD swordfish
- EEL American eel
- TIL tilefish

References Cited

- East Hampton Star. Memorial Reconsidered.
<http://archive.easthamptonstar.com/ehquery/20000106/edit2.htm>
- Drumm, Russell. 1997. *In the Slick of the Cricket: A Shark Odyssey*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Gall, Ken. 1994. Montauk: New York's Largest Fishing Port. *New York's Seafood Council Newsletter* Fall/Winter 1(4). http://www.nyseafood.com/default_breakingnews.asp
- Holland, Adam C. 2002. Area Fishermen to Grieve Their Net Loss. *The Providence Journal* 5/10/02.
http://www.projo.com/news/content/projo_20020510_rifish10.7982f.html
- Horne Rose LLC, Joel Russell, and Lee Weintraub. 2003. *A Comprehensive Plan from 2003-2020 for the Town of East Hampton*. <http://www.town.east-hampton.ny.us/planning/EHCompPlanFinalDraft2003.pdf>
- Kelly, Gene. n.d. *A Little Bit of History*. Montauk Sportfishing.
<http://www.montauksportfishing.com/03-History.htm>
- Matthiessen, Peter. 1986. *Men's Lives: The Surfmen and Baymen of the Southfork*. New York: Random House.
- Montauk-online. 2000a. Carl Fisher: Architect of Montauk. <http://www.montauklife.com/fisher.html>
- Montauk-online. 2000b. Fishing: Montauk's Lifeblood. <http://www.montauklife.com/main5.html>
- Rattray, Helen. 1989. *The South Fork: The Land and the People of Eastern Long Island*. Wainscott, NY: Pushcart Press.
- Tuma, Debbie. 1996. *History of Montauk Shark Fishing*. Montauk Sportfishing.
<http://www.montauksportfishing.com/96debbie.htm>